



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru **The National Assembly for Wales**

Y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd **The Environment and Sustainability Committee**

Dydd Mercher, 18 Mawrth 2015
Wednesday, 18 March 2015

Cynnwys **Contents**

[Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon](#)
[Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions](#)

[Bil Cynllunio \(Cymru\): Cyfnod 2—Trafod y Gwelliannau](#)
[Planning \(Wales\) Bill: Stage 2—Consideration of Amendments](#)

[Grŵp 1: Arolygiaeth Gynllunio Cymru \(Gwelliant 61\)](#)
[Group 1: Planning Inspectorate for Wales \(Amendment 61\)](#)

[Grŵp 2: Diben Statudol \(Gwelliannau 85 a 128\)](#)
[Group 2: Statutory Purpose \(Amendments 85 and 128\)](#)

[Grŵp 3: Fframwaith Datblygu Cenedlaethol \(Gwelliannau 45, 129, 62, 63, 130, 131, 46, 64, 132, 133, 134, 135, 47, 87, 48, 136, 122, 137, 138, 139, 88, 89, 90, 49, 91, 92 a 50\)](#)
[Group 3: National Development Framework \(Amendments 45, 129, 62, 63, 130, 131, 46, 64, 132, 133, 134, 135, 47, 87, 48, 136, 122, 137, 138, 139, 88, 89, 90, 49, 91, 92 and 50\)](#)

[Grŵp 4: Y Gymraeg \(Gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 156, 72, 125, 190, 114 a 121\)](#)
[Group 4: The Welsh Language \(Amendments 1, 2, 3, 156, 72, 125, 190, 114 and 121\)](#)

[Grŵp 5: Cynllunio Strategol \(Gwelliannau 93, 94, 141, 142, 143, 144, 95, 96, 145, 65, 66, 146, 123, 147, 148, 67, 68, 149, 150, 51, 151, 192 a 193\)](#)
[Group 5: Strategic Planning \(Amendments 93, 94, 141, 142, 143, 144, 95, 96, 145, 65, 66, 146, 123, 147, 148, 67, 68, 149, 150, 51, 151, 192 and 193\)](#)

Grŵp 6: Cynnwys y Gymuned (Gwelliannau 69, 98, 113, 78, 115 a 191)
Group 6: Community Involvement (Amendments 69, 98, 113, 78, 115 and 191)

Grŵp 7: Cynlluniau Datblygu Lleol (Gwelliannau 70, 152, 153, 154, 71, 124, 155 a 157)
Group 7: Local Development Plans (Amendments 70, 152, 153, 154, 71, 124, 155 and 157)

Grŵp 8: Asesiadau o'r Effaith ar Iechyd (Gwelliant 99)
Group 8: Health Impact Assessments (Amendment 99)

Grŵp 9: Gweithdrefn Cyn Ymgeisio (Gwelliannau 73, 101, 83 ac 84)
Group 9: Pre-application Procedure (Amendments 73, 101, 83 and 84)

Grŵp 10: Datblygiadau o Arwyddocâd Cenedlaethol (Gwelliannau 100, 158, 159, 102, 103, 160, 161, 104, 162, 163, 164, 165, 166, 167, 168, 169, 170, 171, 172, 53, 112, 86, 120 a 55)
Group 10: Developments of National Significance (Amendments 100, 158, 159, 102, 103, 160, 161, 104, 162, 163, 164, 165, 166, 167, 168, 169, 170, 171, 172, 53, 112, 86, 120 and 55)

Grŵp 11: Drafftio a Thechnegol (Gwelliannau 52, 109, 110, 40, 41, 117, 42 a 43)
Group 11: Drafting and Technical (Amendments 52, 109, 110, 40, 41, 117, 42 and 43)

Grŵp 12: Ceisiadau i Weinidogion Cymru (Gwelliannau 173, 105, 106, 174, 107, 176, 108, 177, 178, 179, 180, 181, 182, 183, 184, 185, 186, 187, 188, 189 ac 111)
Group 12: Applications to Welsh Ministers (Amendments 173, 105, 106, 174, 107, 176, 108, 177, 178, 179, 180, 181, 182, 183, 184, 185, 186, 187, 188, 189 and 111)

Grŵp 13: Gwelliannau Canlyniadol i Orchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Penderfynu Gweithdrefn) (Cymru) 2014 (Gwelliannau 4, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 23, 24, 25, 26 a 27)
Group 13: Consequential Amendments on the Town and Country Planning (Determination of Procedure) (Wales) Order 2014 (Amendments 4, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 23, 24, 25, 26 and 27)

Grŵp 14: Datganiadau Dylunio a Mynediad (Gwelliant 29)
Group 14: Design and Access Statements (Amendment 29)

Grŵp 15: Ceisiadau Annilyd—Hysbysu ac Apelio (Gwelliannau 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39 a 28)
Group 15: Invalid Applications—Notice and Appeal (Amendments 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39 and 28)

Grŵp 16: Byrddau Cynllunio ar y Cyd a Pharciau Cenedlaethol (Gwelliannau 54 a 44)
Group 16: Joint Planning Boards and National Parks (Amendments 54 and 44)

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Mick Antoniw	Llafur Labour
Russell George	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Llyr Gruffydd	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Mike Hedges	Llafur (yn dirprwyo ar ran Jeff Cuthbert) Labour (substitute for Jeff Cuthbert)
Alun Ffred Jones	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)
Julie Morgan	Llafur Labour
William Powell	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Jenny Rathbone	Llafur Labour
Antoinette Sandbach	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Joyce Watson	Llafur Labour

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Sarah Dawson	Cynghorydd Cyfreithiol, Llywodraeth Cymru Legal Adviser, Welsh Government
Neil Hemmington	Prif Swyddog Cynllunio, Llywodraeth Cymru Chief Planning Officer, Welsh Government
Carl Sargeant	Aelod Cynulliad, Llafur (y Gweinidog Cyfoeth Naturiol) Assembly Member, Labour (the Minister for Natural Resources)

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Alun Davidson	Clerc Clerk
Peter Hill	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Lisa Salkeld	Cynghorydd Cyfreithiol Legal Adviser

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 08:59.
The meeting began at 08:59.

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions

[1] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A gaf i'ch croesawu chi i'r pwyllgor: yr Aelodau, y Gweinidog a'i gynghorwyr a'r cyhoedd? Mae'r cyfarfod yn ddwyieithog ac felly defnyddiwch eich clustffonau—rwy'n cymryd bod y cyfieithu yn gweithio. Diolch yn fawr. Mae'r cyfarfod yn cael ei ddarlledu

Alun Ffred Jones: May I welcome you to the committee: the Members, the Minister and his advisers and the public? The meeting is bilingual and therefore use your headphones—I take it that the translation is working. Thank you. The meeting is broadcast and a transcript of the proceedings

a bydd trawsgrifiad o'r trafodion yn cael ei gyhoeddi. A gaf i atgoffa pawb i ddiffodd eu ffonau symudol os gwelwch chi fod yn dda, ac atgoffa'r Aelodau hefyd, a'r tystion—nid oes tystion—nad oes angen cyffwrdd â'r meicroffonau? Os bydd larwm tân, dilynwch y tywyswyr allan. Ymddiheuriadau heddiw gan Jeff Cuthbert, ac mae Mike Hedges yn dirprwyo.

will be published. May I remind people to turn off their mobile phones, please, and remind Members and witnesses—there are no witnesses—that there is no need to touch the microphones? In the event of a fire alarm, follow the ushers out from the room. Apologies today from Jeff Cuthbert, and Mike Hedges is substituting.

[2] O ran trefn heddiw, rwy'n gobeithio cael egwyl am 10.30 a.m. ac wedyn, os na fyddwn ni'n gallu cael gwared ar y gwelliannau i gyd, ac mae yna restr gweddol faith, yna byddaf i'n gohirio'r adrannau sydd heb eu cwblhau tan yr wythnos nesaf. Ond, fe gawn ni weld sut y mae pethau yn mynd.

In relation to the order of today, I hope to have a break at 10.30 a.m. and then if we aren't able to dispose of all the amendments, and there is quite a long list, then we will defer the sections that haven't been agreed until next week. But we'll see how things go.

09:00

Bil Cynllunio (Cymru): Cyfnod 2—Trafod y Gwelliannau Planning (Wales) Bill: Stage 2—Consideration of Amendments

Grŵp 1: Arolygiaeth Gynllunio Cymru (Gwelliant 61) Group 1: Planning Inspectorate for Wales (Amendment 61)

[3] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, mi drown ni at y grŵp cyntaf o welliannau sy'n ymwneud ag arolygiaeth gynllunio Cymru. Yr unig welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 61 yn enw William Powell. Felly, galwaf ar William i gynnig gwelliant 61 a siarad i'w welliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: Therefore, we'll turn to the first group of amendments that relate to the planning inspectorate for Wales. The only amendment in the group is amendment 61 in the name of William Powell. I therefore call on William to move amendment 61 and speak to his amendment.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 61 (William Powell).
Amendment 61 (William Powell) moved.*

[4] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Good morning, all. I'd like to start just by indicating that this amendment is being brought forward very much as a probing amendment to promote some productive discussion around this issue. Clearly the establishment of a separate planning inspectorate for Wales would entail significant further amendments and changes to existing legislation at a later stage, and I understand that. Within committee, we've seen evidence to suggest that a separate planning inspectorate for Wales would deliver significant benefits, particularly in the context of the Welsh language in the planning system, but also more widely, and also given the increasing divergence that there is between the planning regimes that are now developing in England and in Wales as a direct consequence of devolution. Also, it would seem to me to be applying the same logic that drove the creation of Natural Resources Wales and would seem curious to resile from that, having vested that body in the way that we have. I would, therefore, be grateful if the Minister could indicate whether any further consideration has been made on this issue because I'm aware of his initial position, as previously indicated. I seek to move that amendment.

[5] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes rhywun arall eisiau siarad? Russell George.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you very much. Are there other Members who wish to speak? Russell George.

[6] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. We won't be supporting this particular amendment. When the independent advisory group undertook its consultation to compile its report, they did indicate that only two respondents argued that a separate body for Wales was required. So, I just don't think that this concept has got legs at this time.

[7] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr.

[8] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Mi fyddaf i'n cefnogi'r gwelliant yma, yn amlwg, oherwydd y gwir yw bod y trefniadau cynllunio yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr yn symud yn raddol i gyfeiriadau gwahanol. Mae'r ffaith ein bod yn trafod rhyw 200 o welliannau i Fil Cynllunio (Cymru) yn dyst i hynny. Mi wnaeth y cyn Weinidog cynllunio, John Griffiths, yn eistedd yn y sedd yna rhyw ddwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl—rwy'n meddwl mai craffu cyn-ddeddfwriaethol oedd y sesiwn—gydnabod wrth i'r systemau cynllunio esblygu i gyfeiriadau gwahanol yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr y byddai'r achos dros greu arolygiaeth gynllunio annibynnol i Gymru yn cryfhau gydag amser. Rwy'n meddwl ein bod ni'n dechrau cyrraedd y pwynt yna nawr ac y mae'r Bil yma, fel yr oeddwn yn ei ddweud, yn dyst i hynny. Mae egwyddor sylfaenol fan hyn, rwy'n meddwl, fel sydd wedi cael ei chyfeirio ati yn barod, o greu corff Cymreig i adlewyrchu anghenion arbennig Cymru a pholisïau unigryw Cymru, fel sydd wedi cael ei dderbyn yn y drafodaeth y cyfeiriwyd ati ynglŷn â Chyfoeth Naturiol Cymru. Roedd Llywodraeth Cymru yn dadlau o blaid yr egwyddor honno bryd hynny ac nid wyf yn meddwl bod yna unrhyw reswm pam na all y Llywodraeth gefnogi'r gwelliant yma ar sail yr un egwyddor.

Llyr Gruffydd: Thank you, Chair. I will be supporting this amendment because the truth is that the planning arrangements in Wales and in England are gradually moving in different directions. The fact that we're discussing some 200 amendments to the Planning (Wales) Bill is testament to that. The former Minister for planning, John Griffiths, sitting in that very seat some two or three years ago—when we were discussing, I think, pre-legislative scrutiny—did acknowledge that as the planning systems do evolve in different directions in England and in Wales, the case for creating an independent planning inspectorate for Wales would strengthen over time. I think that we are starting to reach that point now and this legislation, as I said, is testament to that. There is a fundamental principle at stake here, as has already been referred to, of creating a Welsh body to reflect the particular needs of Wales and the unique policies of Wales, as has been accepted in the debate referred to on Natural Resources Wales. The Welsh Government argued in favour of that principle at that point and I don't believe there's any reason why the Government couldn't support this amendment on the basis of the same principle.

[9] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Antoinette Sandbach.

[10] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I obviously very much agree with what Russell George said: only two witnesses argued for this. I think when we're looking at things like nationally significant infrastructure projects, many of which may have cross-border implications and many of which may require specialist knowledge from the Planning Inspectorate—and I'm thinking in north Wales, for example, about issues around Wylfa—I think it's very important to have that cross-border expertise. I feel that it will only benefit the Planning Inspectorate for England and Wales to learn more about the Welsh planning system and to understand and know what the differences are. I think the pool of expertise that we can call on at the moment is one that we should retain and I think that's an important principle.

[11] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Gweinidog. Minister.

[12] **The Minister for Natural Resources (Carl Sargeant):** Thank you, Chair. First of all, it's very clear that I'm not John Griffiths, and maybe I have different views to John Griffiths. The issue of this Planning (Wales) Bill is an important one, as Members have raised. I haven't seen any evidence to suggest that the Planning Inspectorate for England and Wales is not effective in its duty. It bases its evidence and decision making on local development plans made in Wales and Welsh policy made in Wales. So, I do not see there are any advantages to splitting this off. In fact, a point that both Russell George and Antoinette Sandbach made regarding resilience of support and services across the UK is very helpful to the department. At this point in time, it is not the view of Government to support this amendment.

[13] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. William Powell i ymateb i'r ddadl. **William Powell:** Thank you very much. William Powell to respond to the debate.

[14] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I'm grateful to colleagues for their contributions. I hear what the Minister said, which confirms a position that he'd previously adopted, as he's been consistent in this approach. I am disappointed by his consistency on this occasion. I sort of go back to my earlier points, really, with regard to applying the logic that we have sought to apply in the creation of Natural Resources Wales, which appears to be bedding down well and is actually testament to the benefits of a distinct Welsh organisation, which doesn't mean that we don't have cross-border co-operation where it's appropriate, and I'm not implying that the current arrangements are dysfunctional or ineffective; I'm trying to futureproof this and that's the spirit in which I'm promoting this amendment.

[15] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A ydych chi'n **Alun Ffred Jones:** Do you wish to move to a dymuno symud i bleidlais ar welliant 61, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Do you wish to move to a vote on amendment 61, William? William?

[16] **William Powell:** Yes.

[17] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 61? Unrhyw amendment 61 be agreed. Any objection? wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Iawn. [*Objection.*] Okay. We'll move to a vote. Symudwn i bleidlais. Felly, y rhai sydd o Therefore, those in favour, raise your hands. blaid i godi eu dwylo. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'r Those against. That vote is—. The bleidlais honno wedi—. Ni dderbynnir y amendment is not agreed. gwelliant.

*Gwelliant 61: O blaid 3, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 61: For 3, Abstain 7, Against 0.*

O blaid:
For:

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Antoniw, Mick
George, Russell
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Sandbach, Antoinette
Watson, Joyce

Ymatal:
Abstain:

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 61.
Amendment 61 not agreed.*

Grŵp 2: Diben Statudol (Gwelliannau 85 a 128)
Group 2: Statutory Purpose (Amendments 85 and 128)

[18] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn ymlaen i grŵp 2, diben statudol, a gwelliannau 85 a 128. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 85, yn enw Russell George. Galwaf ar Russell i symud gwelliant 85 a siarad i'r gwelliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: We move on to group 2, statutory purpose, and amendments 85 and 128. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 85, in the name of Russell George. I call on Russell to move amendment 85 and speak to his amendment.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 85 (Russell George).
Amendment 85 (Russell George) moved.

[19] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. I move amendment 85. There has been considerable evidence, not just in the consultation responses that we received at Stage 1, but also in other Government-led consultations, not least a clear recommendation within the final report of the independent advisory group that a statutory purpose for planning should be inserted on the face of the Bill. Now, given the weight of evidence, I was a little surprised by the Minister's response to the specific recommendation, recommendation 4, in his letter of 26 February. I don't quite understand the rationale for his refusal as set out in that letter. The independent advisory group report said that the definition of 'sustainable development' should come from what was then the sustainability Bill and there should be no legal definition in the Planning (Wales) Bill, which, given the intended overarching nature of what is now the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill, is an approach I'm happy to support.

[20] However, we need to be clear about why we are legislating and what the purpose is and what the objectives are of this particular Bill, otherwise it's just going to be merely a regulatory process. The independent advisory group report states that planning should be seen as more than a regulatory activity, and, if it is just seen in those narrow confines, it will deliver negative rather than positive outcomes. So, I think it's perfectly acceptable to set out the core purpose for planning on the face of the Bill. It doesn't detract from the Government's policy objectives of either the Bill or the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill, but rather it strengthens the linkages between both pieces of legislation, reinforcing the point that sustainable development must be the central principle for all planning decisions, which can only be beneficial.

[21] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr Gruffydd i siarad.

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr Gruffydd to speak.

[22] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 128 yn fy enw i. Fel rŷm ni wedi clywed, fe wnaeth adroddiad y grŵp cynghori annibynnol bwysleisio bod 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru', yn adran 1.2.1, yn datgan fod y system gynllunio ddim ond yn 'rheoleiddio' datblygiad a defnydd tir, ac mae'r adroddiad, fel y dywedodd Russell George, yn dod i'r casgliad fod hynny'n debygol o ddod â chanlyniadau negyddol yn hytrach na chadarnhaol. Ac, wrth gwrs, mae'r Gweinidog yn sôn am gael newid diwylliannol o fewn y drefn gynllunio, a rhyw fath o olwg mwy cadarnhaol ar y modd y mae'r drefn yn hwyluso penderfyniadau. Yn amlwg, rwy'n teimlo y byddai cael

Llyr Gruffydd: Thank you, Chair. I move amendment 128 in my name. As we have heard, the independent advisory group report emphasised that 'Planning Policy Wales', in section 1.2.1, states that the planning system only 'regulates' the development and use of land, and the report, as Russell George said, comes to conclusion that that is likely to bring negative impacts rather than positive. And, of course, the Minister talks of having a culture change within the planning regime, and some kind of more positive view on the way in which the system facilitates decisions. Clearly, I feel that having a clear statutory purpose for planning on the face of the Bill would be of assistance in promoting that

pwrpas statudol clir ar wyneb y Bil yn help i hyrwyddo'r newid *mindset* yna o gwmpas y drefn gynllunio. Mae ein gwelliant ni yn datgan yn glir, felly, beth yw pwrpas y system gynllunio ac yn ei gysylltu â datblygu cynaliadwy sydd, wrth gwrs, fel rŷm ni wedi gweld ddoe yn y Senedd yma, yn rhywbeth y mae bron y pleidiau i gyd yn ymrwymo iddo fe, neu, o leiaf, yr egwyddor y mae'r pleidiau i gyd yn ymrwymo iddo fe.

change in the mindset around the planning system. Our amendment clearly states, therefore, what the purpose of the planning system is and links it with sustainable development, which, of course, as we saw yesterday in the Senedd here, is something that almost all parties are committed to, or certainly the principle that all parties are committed to.

[23] Mi fyddai rhoi diben statudol i'r system gynllunio ar wyneb y Bil yn cryfhau'r broses gynllunio, yn fy marn i, ac yn rhoi eglurder i awdurdodau cynllunio ar ba ystyriaethau y dylen nhw eu cymryd i'r cof wrth wneud penderfyniadau. Mi fyddai hefyd, meddai nhw wrthyf i, yn gwireddu addewid maniffesto'r blaid Lafur, ac rwy'n dyfynnu:

Placing a statutory purpose for planning on the face of the Bill would strengthen the planning regime, in my view, and would provide clarity for planning authorities on what considerations they should take into account in making decisions. It would also, so they tell me, actually achieve a Labour party manifesto pledge, and I quote:

[24] 'Deddfwriaethu i greu cymunedau mwy cynaliadwy trwy'r system gynllunio.... Sicrhau bod cynlluniau datblygu yn adlewyrchu'r cyfrifoldeb i gyflwyno cymunedau cynaliadwy ar draws Cymru'.

'Legislate to create more sustainable communities through the planning system.... Ensure development plans reflect the responsibility to deliver sustainable communities across Wales'.

[25] Felly, nid wyf yn meddwl bod yna ddim byd yn fy ngwelliant i sy'n anghydnaws â'r cyfeiriad y byddai'r Llywodraeth yma, rwy'n siŵr, yn awyddus i symud iddo fe.

So, I don't think there's anything in my amendment that is not in keeping with the direction that this Government, I'm sure, would be keen to move in.

[26] Mi fyddaf yn pleidleisio yn erbyn gwelliant 85, oherwydd, yn syml, mi fydd ein gwelliant ni yn cwmpo petai e'n cael ei dderbyn. Rwyf hefyd yn teimlo bod ein gwelliant ni yn gryfach ac, wrth gwrs, hefyd yn cynnwys cyfeiriad at Fil Llesiant Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol (Cymru), oedd yn destun trafodaeth â thipyn o gonsensws yn y Cynulliad yma ddoe, wrth gwrs.

I will be voting against amendment 85, because, simply, our amendment would fall if it were agreed. I also feel that our amendment is stronger and, of course, it also includes reference to the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill, which was the subject of discussion and some consensus in this Assembly here yesterday, of course.

[27] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes unrhyw Aelod arall sy'n dymuno siarad? William Powell.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you very much. Are there other Members who wish to speak? William Powell.

[28] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I'm moving no amendment at this stage on behalf of our group, but, given the importance and significance of the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill, which culminated yesterday, I do believe, very much, that including a statutory purpose for planning is of great importance, and maybe this is something we can look for in some further detail at Stage 3. It would not only be valuable for this Bill to be explicit on the purpose of the planning process, but, as has been described previously, there has to be a clear and demonstrable link to sustainable development and, for that reason, I shall be supporting the amendments here today.

[29] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Weinidog. Minister.

[30] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I've listened carefully to the comments of committee and I've given this further consideration outside of committee. I am willing to introduce an amendment to the Bill on a statutory purpose for the planning system. However, the drafting of the current amendments, we believe, needs to be amended in order for us to lay these at a later date at Stage 3. Therefore, I would ask Members not to support these amendments today, or not to move them, and I will introduce an amendment at Stage 3.

[31] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Diolch yn fawr. Russell i ymateb. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay. Thank you very much. Russell to reply.

[32] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. The amendment, of course, uses the suggested wording as set out in the independent advisory report. But, given what the Minister has said in his commitment made this morning, Chair, I'm happy to withdraw my amendment, if that's possible.

[33] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae Russell yn dymuno tynnu'r gwelliant yn ôl. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad i dynnu'r gwelliant yn ôl? Nac oes. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell wishes to withdraw the amendment. Any objection to withdrawing the amendment? No.

*Tynnwyd gwelliant 85 yn ôl gyda chaniatâd y pwyllgor.
Amendment 85 withdrawn by leave of the committee.*

[34] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, mae cynnig Llyr yn aros, os ydy—. Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno symud eich gwelliant chi? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Therefore, Llyr's proposal remains, if he—. Llyr, do you wish to move your amendment?

[35] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ar sail yr hyn mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i ddweud, wnaif i ddim symud y gwelliant. **Llyr Gruffydd:** On the basis of what the Minister has said, I will not move the amendment.

[36] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Reit. A ydych yn gytûn? A ydy pawb yn hapus i Llyr Gruffydd i dynnu ei welliant yn ôl? Iawn. Felly, mae'r gwelliannau yna wedi'u tynnu'n ôl. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right. Are you agreed? Is everybody content for Llyr Gruffydd to withdraw his amendment? Right. Therefore, those amendments have been withdrawn.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 128 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 128 (Llyr Gruffydd) not moved.*

Grŵp 3: Fframwaith Datblygu Cenedlaethol (Gwelliannau 45, 129, 62, 63, 130, 131, 46, 64, 132, 133, 134, 135, 47, 87, 48, 136, 122, 137, 138, 139, 88, 89, 90, 49, 91, 92 a 50)
Group 3: National Development Framework (Amendments 45, 129, 62, 63, 130, 131, 46, 64, 132, 133, 134, 135, 47, 87, 48, 136, 122, 137, 138, 139, 88, 89, 90, 49, 91, 92 and 50)

[37] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym yn symud ymlaen, felly, i grŵp 3, sy'n ymwneud â fframwaith datblygu cenedlaethol, ac mae nifer o welliannau yma. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 45 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad am ei welliant a'r gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp hwn. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Moving on, therefore, to group 3, relating to the national development framework, there are a number of amendments here. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 45 in the name of the Minister. I call on the Minister to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in this group.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 45 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 45 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[38] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I seek to ask you to move amendments in the Government's name in this group. Government amendment 45 provides clarity that, if a national development framework expires, the requirement for Welsh Ministers to produce a national framework remains.

[39] Amendment 46 addresses recommendation 20 of this committee, and this requires a national development framework to specify a time period to have an effect after which it no longer has development plan status. I've also taken on board the recommendations of the committee and I consider it would be consistent for the national development framework to specify the period for which it has effect, which is in line with both the strategic and local development plans.

09:15

[40] Amendment 47 addresses recommendation 17. The amendment requires the NDF to be subject to a public consultation for a 12-week period. I agree also with committee that a statutory time period for consultation should be set out. However, I consider that a 12-week timescale for public consultation is appropriate, as typical for most consultation documents that Welsh Government issue. Amendment 48 is a consequential of 47, and 49 again is a response to a committee recommendation, recommendation 19, which requires Welsh Ministers to publish a statement alongside the NDF setting out how they have addressed the recommendations of the Assembly. Amendment 50 is consequential of 47, and I also consider that 47 and 50 respond to the committee's recommendations and improve the Bill, and I call on Members to support them.

[41] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Llyr Gruffydd i siarad. Llyr Gruffydd to speak.

[42] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch. I move amendments 129 through to 139. We'll be supporting the vast majority of amendments in this group. Amendment 46 from the Minister might be the only exception, to be honest, because I need to understand maybe what the Minister's intention is with setting termination dates for an NDF. I've concerns around what would happen to other development plans that might have been built to adhere to the NDF when the NDF expires, and it seems to me that it would be wiser to have a system where the NDF and other development plans actually are effective until they're replaced.

[43] Amendment 129 of ours will require the NDF to set out

[44] 'policies designed to contribute to climate change reduction targets and adaptation'.

[45] The need to tackle climate change is well evidenced and scientifically and politically accepted, as was reflected in support for Plaid Cymru's motion on statutory climate change targets recently. However, I do feel that action on climate change suffers from a lack of coherence in policy and decision making, and in order to generate a step change in thinking about development decisions, it's necessary to provide specific status for this particular issue on the face of the Bill.

[46] Amendment 130 is to put in writing the Government's recent commitment, or at least my understanding of the Government's commitment, to place a moratorium on fracking in Wales. Since the vote in the Senedd to call on the Welsh Government to do all it can to prevent fracking from taking place in Wales, there's been much confusion, I believe, around

what powers this place does or doesn't have. So, if indeed we do have the power to implement a moratorium, let's provide the public with the clarity that would come with this amendment and put it in black and white in the Planning (Wales) Bill, something I'm sure, in principle, we're all happy to support.

[47] Amendment 131 places a duty on those developing the national development framework to consider the long term. Now, the need to consider long-term issues is already set out in the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill, of course, but in order to consider this in planning, I think it's rational to include a time frame to make sure that we embed that long-term thinking, because, arguably, planning, more than any other field, requires that long-term take. Short-termism won't deliver sustainable development and it'll lead to poor decision making. The proposed 100-year time frame hasn't just been picked out of the air, you'll be glad to hear. There is a precedent. The city of Vancouver, actually, has developed a 100-year sustainability vision, which has received international plaudits.

[48] 'Operating under the themes of livability, sustainability, and resilience, this 100-year plan looks at likely scenarios, challenges, and opportunities in the coming decades allowing the city to develop more forward-thinking policy planning and to be a better, stronger advocate for regional, provincial, and federal sustainability legislation.'

[49] The long-term vision they have aims to guide the city towards carbon-neutral status by 2107, which will be the city's 200th anniversary. I think that's the kind of culture change around real long-term time frame thinking that we need to drive and embed through this Planning Bill into the planning system in Wales.

[50] Amendment 132, in the same vein as many of my other amendments that we'll see later on, seeks to reverse this shifting of power that we're seeing up the planning chain, if you like, in this Bill. I'm an advocate, as I've probably rehearsed very often in this committee and elsewhere, of starting with citizens and communities and working out from there. Yes, there will always be issues of national significance that will require decisions at a national level, but your starting point should always be from the bottom up, and we shouldn't be starting from a point where the national development framework dictates to strategic development plans, which, in turn, dictate to local development plans. That is top-down. Amendment 132 is an effort to redress that balance, and placing a duty on Welsh Ministers to have regard to each local development plan when developing the framework means that they can't disregard that particular local tier, which is important to communities across Wales.

[51] Amendments 134, 136, 137, 138 and 139 will require the national development framework to be independently examined, and for the recommendations to be made public. It's important, in my view, that the public has an opportunity to properly scrutinise the NDF. Any person wishing to amend the NDF should be given the chance to appear before the independent examiner to make a case for amendment. Amendment 92, from Russell George, is proposing that the National Assembly for Wales carries out the independent examination of the NDF. Our amendment 136 differs, in that I feel that's a process the Welsh Government could carry out, as long, of course, as the National Assembly for Wales has a role in approving it. I'll be supporting amendment 122—is that in this group?

[52] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes.

[53] **Llyr Gruffydd:** I'll be supporting amendment 122 from Suzy Davies, which is part of an important series of amendments strengthening provision around the Welsh language in the Bill. Finally, amendment 135. Now, structural inequality in our society means that some people are more likely to suffer discrimination and have less access to resources depending on their race, socioeconomic status, disability, gender, sexuality, faith and other factors. Now, these people are less likely to live in a clean and healthy environment with the associated

impacts that come with that. The Equality and Human Rights Commission has suggested that these people are also underrepresented in local decision making, and I'm sure we'd all agree that any new planning tier must work for the whole community. So, this amendment 135 places a duty to have regard to socioeconomic disadvantage in decision making at NDF level, and I've also tabled similar amendments in the context of the local development plans and the strategic development plans.

[54] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. William Powell.

[55] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I move amendments 62, 63 and 64, tabled in my name. Amendment 62, and indeed amendments 65 and 67 in group 5, are all designed to implement recommendation 12 of this committee's report, which is to establish a clear link between statutory national and regional transport planning arrangements, and to link this to the national development framework and also the SDPs, the strategic development plans. Transport planning has been a consistent area of concern for the committee, and the imperative for the integration of transport planning into wider spatial planning is indeed very important—for example, road access, schools within walking distance of new housing developments, public transport provision and the monitoring of traffic flow and potential impact. While I understand that links to transport planning are already explicit in the regulations for LDPs and that there is an intention for this to be similarly included in secondary legislation for the strategic development plans that are envisaged, this amendment is about making a specific link in the Planning (Wales) Bill between statutory national transport planning arrangements under the Transport Act 2000, and also the Transport (Wales) Act 2006, on the one hand, and the national development framework. I therefore ask that Members support this amendment today, so that this explicit link can be made, which also respects the recommendation that this committee made at an earlier time. In terms of committee recommendation 11, I shall be coming back to this under group 7, but I do have several amendments tabled today, which all seek to address this important recommendation to ensure that marine and terrestrial planning are closely aligned, and that due regard is paid to the interrelationships that exist between the two environments. Amendment 64 in this group also serves to support this purpose, as indeed do amendments in groups 5 and 7, which we will come to later. I shall be supporting the vast majority of amendments that are tabled in this group. Thank you very much.

[56] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Russell George i siarad. Russell George to speak.

[57] **Russell George:** Chair, I speak to and move amendments 87, 88, 89, 90, 91 and 92 in this group. I think the national development framework is a sensible successor to the Wales spatial plan. However, what is important is that the Government have learned the mistakes of the Wales spatial plan, and in the development of the NDF, it allows the scrutiny process to be conducted in a manner that is full, independent and transparent so we get a national plan that is fit for purpose.

[58] Now, as the NDF will have full development plan status, the consequences of it not being produced correctly are, of course, serious because of the effect it will have downstream on the tiers of development planning that sit below it, all of which could make policy difficult to unpick or even decisions impossible to correct. So, I firmly believe that the Minister must go further than to just have regard to the view of the National Assembly on the NDF. I believe it should allow this institution the ability to determine and conduct the examination process on its own terms within Standing Orders, with sufficient safeguards in place, and that it formally approves the NDF by resolution, and that the purpose and intended effect of these amendments are—. That's the purpose behind these amendments. But allowing the Assembly to comprehensively examine and formally sign off the NDF would add, I think, significant legitimacy to the whole process. So, if this amendment's agreed, then obviously further

consequential amendments will be required at Stage 3.

[59] I'm also pleased to speak to and move amendment 122 in the name of Suzy Davies. I'm pleased to hear Llyr's support for this amendment as well. This amendment seeks to clarify the status—in this case a sustainability appraisal, as required by section 2. Section 2 replaces section 60 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 and replaces it with a series of new sections: 60A, 60B and 60C. Now, under the new section 60B(1)(b), Ministers must carry out an appraisal of the sustainability or policies set out in the national development framework for Wales. So, amendment 122 simply requires Ministers to have regard to that appraisal. So, in short, there's no point requiring an appraisal if regard or due regard is not paid, or if it is not treated as a material consideration. So, the Bill and various amendments use a combination of these terms effectively meaning the same, but Suzy has chosen 'regard' as that is the term used in the original draft of the Bill. So, the Minister may, of course, argue that there's no need for this amendment as the need for due regard is implied, but Suzy and I would argue that, when it comes to statute, nothing should be implied. It should be stated, it should be clear and certain, especially when you have new primary legislation. Furthermore, in evidence, you have stated your intention that this Bill is being introduced to bring consistency to all planning authorities, in which case the Bill itself needs to be consistent also. Section 5 introduces a duty on strategic planning policy to have regard to a series of considerations, and there is no question of the need for due regard being applied there.

[60] Three of Suzy Davies's amendments relating to due regard speak directly to sustainability appraisals. The argument could be extended to other types of appraisal or impact assessments in the Bill; however, as sustainability is supposed to be the core concept, a key thread that runs through all Welsh Government policy and legislation, I hope, Minister, that you can demonstrate that you have not forgotten that by recognising the need for a specific due regard obligation on those who are under a duty to draw sustainability appraisals.

[61] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much, Russell. Unrhyw Aelod arall? Jenny Russell. Are there any other Members who Rathbone. wish to speak? Jenny Rathbone.

[62] **Jenny Rathbone:** I just want to pick up on a point mentioned by Llyr Gruffydd, which is around what happens if we have an expiry date for the national development plan. What, then, is the legal situation, because it could be that there's some discussion about the framework of the new one? In the past, people have wanted to take advantage of the absence of any clear framework to push through things that wouldn't otherwise have happened. So, I wondered if the Minister could just clarify that.

[63] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Diolch yn fawr. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog, felly, i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Fine. Thank you very much. I call on the Minister, therefore, to reply to the debate.

[64] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I thank Members for their series of questions and observations. I'll pick up the point that Jenny and Llyr raised first of all on the NDF. It is our intention, as drafted in the Bill, and I believe the committee's recommendations around allocating a time frame for end of plan—. It's the intention, of the drafting, to keep the plan updated and reviewed every five years.

09:30

[65] So there is a constant update of the plan, but it was a recommendation to have an end procedure for the plan. It would, of course, be the intention of a Government to continue to update every five years, and then to introduce a new plan, but the original plan will have an end date for consistency as recommended by this committee.

[66] On some of the other points that were raised, Llyr raised one around socioeconomic background and circumstances. The Member will be aware that, on 10 March, following considerable discussions with my Labour colleagues, we introduced into the goal of the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill the issue around a more equal Wales with regard to socioeconomic background. We believe that we have more consistency now with that being passed in the future generations Bill yesterday, as it enables all public bodies in the public sector and planning authorities to take note of how they intend to apply the future generations Bill. There is a sense of irony in that opposition Conservative Members continued to talk about sustainable development yesterday, yet the irony is that they voted against the Bill completely yesterday. So, I'm not quite sure where they stand on sustainable development at all.

[67] With regard to other points Llyr made regarding the issue around Vancouver and the 100 years, that's an interesting case that the Member raises. I'm not unsympathetic to the principle of what is being suggested there, but the NDF plan will be there for 20 years, in situ. We voted yesterday on the future generations Bill, which has a 2050 target date as a long-term vision. The NDF is not prohibitive and must include a long-term vision within that, which could indeed be 100 years, but I will give some more thought to what that means. I'd probably prefer not to put 100 years in the Bill, but certainly if it means issuing guidance about what long-term vision we consider, then that's something I will give further consideration to.

[68] My final point on the contributions made by Members is around what Llyr mentioned, the amendment regarding fracking. Our position as a Government is very clear about fracking: we want to see the devolution of the petroleum exploration and development licences. That has been the consistent message. It is unhelpful to keep suggesting that there is no clarity around the planning consent of fracking. The direction letter has been issued to local authorities, and I am very clear, and my department is very clear, on where we stand on this principle.

[69] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn, diolch yn fawr, Weinidog. Cynigiaf welliant 45 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A ydych yn dymuno symud i bleidlais?
Alun Ffred Jones: Okay, thank you, Minister. I move amendment 45 in the name of the Minister. Do you wish to proceed to a vote?

[70] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, please.

[71] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 45? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Os nad oes, mae'r gwelliant wedi ei dderbyn.
Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 45 be agreed. Does any Member object? If there's no objection, the amendment is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 45 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
 Amendment 45 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[72] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych yn dymuno cynnig gwelliant 129?
Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 129?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 129 (Llyr Gruffydd).
 Amendment 129 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[73] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[74] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that

a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 129? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb o blaid gwelliant 129. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, ac mae fy mhleidlais fwrw i yn mynd yn erbyn y gwelliant, felly mae'r gwelliant wedi syrthio.

amendment 129 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll proceed to a vote. Those in favour of amendment 129. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, therefore the amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 129: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 129: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 129.
Amendment 129 not agreed.*

[75] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 62?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 62?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 62 (William Powell).
Amendment 62 (William Powell) moved.*

[76] **William Powell:** Move.

[77] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 62? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais. Y rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Y rhai yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal, felly pleidlais fwrw. Fel Cadeirydd rwy'n pleidleisio yn erbyn, felly ni dderbynnir gwelliant 62.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 62 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] So, we move to a vote. Those in favour please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote as Chair in the negative, therefore amendment 62 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 62: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 62: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â

Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 62.
Amendment 62 not agreed.*

[78] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, amendment 63? gwelliant 63?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 63 (William Powell).
Amendment 63 (William Powell) moved.*

[79] **William Powell:** Move.

[80] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 63? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb o blaid gwelliant 63 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal, mae pleidlais fwrw, felly ni dderbynnir gwelliant 63.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 63 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. Those in favour of amendment 63 please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote against, therefore amendment 63 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 63: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 63: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 63.
Amendment 63 not agreed.*

[81] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych yn dymuno cynnig gwelliant 130? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 130?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 130 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 130 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[82] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[83] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 130? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Y rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Pleidlais gyfartal. Felly, mae fy

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 130 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] Proceed to a vote. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote

mhleidlais fwrw i fel Cadeirydd yn mynd yn as Chair against the amendment. Therefore, it
erbyn y gwelliant, felly, ni dderbynnir ef. is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 130: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 130: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 130.
Amendment 130 not agreed.*

[84] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 131? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 131?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 131 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 131 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[85] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[86] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 131? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 131 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Pawb yn erbyn. Cyfartal, felly, rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant. Ni dderbyniwyd 131. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 131 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] So, proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 131, please show. All those against. A tie, so I use my casting vote against the amendment. 131 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 131: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 131: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 131.

Amendment 131 not agreed.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 46 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 46 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[87] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 46 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 46? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Gwrthwynebiad. Felly, rydym ni'n symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 46 i godi eu dwylo. Diolch yn fawr. Pawb sydd yn erbyn—sorri, a gaf i gymryd rhan yn y bleidlais yna? Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 46 i ddangos—sorri. Iawn. Ac yn erbyn? Mae'r gwelliant wedi ei gario.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 46 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 46 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] Objection. Therefore, we proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 46, please raise your hands. Thank you very much. All those against—I'm sorry, may I take part in that vote? All in favour of amendment 46 to show—sorry. Right. Those against? The amendment is carried.

*Gwelliant 46: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 2.
Amendment 46: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 2.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

Antoniw, Mick
George, Russell
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Powell, William
Rathbone, Jenny
Sandbach, Antoinette
Watson, Joyce

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 46.
Amendment 46 agreed.*

[88] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 64?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 64?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 64 (William Powell).
Amendment 64 (William Powell) moved.*

[89] **William Powell:** Move.

[90] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 64? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 64 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Yn erbyn? Rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais yn erbyn—pleidlais fwrw—felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 64.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 64 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 64, please show. Those against? I use my casting vote in the negative; therefore, amendment 64 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 64: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 64: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 64.
Amendment 64 not agreed.*

[91] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 132?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 132?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 132 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 132 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[92] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[93] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 132? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 132 i ddangos. Yn erbyn. Rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw i, gan ei bod hi'n gyfartal, yn erbyn. Ni dderbyniwyd 132.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 132 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 132, please show. Those against. I use my casting vote, as there is a tie, in the negative. 132 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 132: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 132: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 132.
Amendment 132 not agreed.*

[94] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 133?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 133?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 133 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 133 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[95] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[96] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 133? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 133 i ddangos. Yn erbyn. Cyfartal, felly rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn gwelliant 133. Ni dderbyniwyd ef.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 133 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] So, all those in favour of amendment 133, please show. Those against. A tie, so I use my casting vote against amendment 133. It was not agreed.

*Gwelliant 133: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 133: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 133.
Amendment 133 not agreed.*

[97] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 134?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 134?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 134 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 134 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[98] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[99] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynnir gwelliant 134, bydd gwelliannau 135 a 47 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 134? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 134 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal, felly rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn 134.

Alun Ffred Jones: If amendment 134 is agreed, amendments 135 and 47 will fall. The question is that amendment 134 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 154, please show. Against. A tie, so I use my casting vote against 134.

*Gwelliant 134: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 134: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny

Sandbach, Antoinette

Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 134.
Amendment 134 not agreed.*

[100] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 135?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 135?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 135 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 135 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[101] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[102] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 135? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 135 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal, felly rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn gwelliant 135. Ni dderbyniwyd ef.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 135 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 135, please show. Against. A tie, so I use my casting vote against amendment 135. It is not agreed.

Gwelliant 135: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 135: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 135.
Amendment 135 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 47 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 47 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[103] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 47 rwy'n ei gynnig yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 47? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Derbyniwyd gwelliant 47.

Alun Ffred Jones: Amendment 47 I move in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 47 be agreed. Any objection? Amendment 47 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 47 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.

Amendment 47 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

[104] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 87? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 87?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 87 (Russell George).
Amendment 87 (Russell George) moved.*

[105] **Russell George:** Yes, move.

[106] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 87? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Cyfartal, felly rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 87. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 87 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Against. A tie, so I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 87 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 87: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 87: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
------------------	-----------------------	---------------------

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 87.
Amendment 87 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 48 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 48 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[107] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 48 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 48? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Derbyniwyd gwelliant 48. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 48 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 48 be agreed. Any objection? Amendment 48 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 48 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 48 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[108] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 136? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 136?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 136 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 136 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[109] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[110] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 136? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 136 i ddangos. Yn erbyn. Cyfartal, felly rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant. Mae o wedi cael ei wrthod.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 136 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 136, please show. Against. A tie, so I use my casting vote against the amendment. It is not agreed.

Gwelliant 136: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 136: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 136.
Amendment 136 not agreed.*

Grŵp 4: Y Gymraeg (Gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 156, 72, 125, 190, 114 a 121)

Group 4: The Welsh Language (Amendments 1, 2, 3, 156, 72, 125, 190, 114 and 121)

[111] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn ymlaen, felly, i grŵp 4, sy'n ymwneud â lle'r Gymraeg o fewn y drefn gynllunio. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 1, y gwelliant cyntaf, yn enw'r Gweinidog. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad am ei welliant a'r gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp.

Alun Ffred Jones: Moving on, therefore, to group 4, relating to the place of the Welsh language in the planning system. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 1, the first one, in the name of the Minister. I call the Minister to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in this group.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 1 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 1 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[112] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. My amendments 1, 2 and 3 seek to introduce requirements into the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 to undertake assessments of the likely effects of the national development framework, the strategic development plans and the local development plans on the use of the Welsh language. These amendments relate to recommendation 6 from this committee, to ensure that the Welsh language is given proper consideration in the formulation of plans at all levels. We believe we've addressed that recommendation and would ask you to formally move these.

[113] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Galwaf ar Llyr Gruffydd i siarad.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you. I call on Llyr Gruffydd to speak.

[114] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Byddaf i'n cefnogi pob un gwelliant yn y

Llyr Gruffydd: Thank you, Chair. I will be supporting all amendments in this group,

grŵp yma, heblaw am welliant 156. Ni fyddaf yn cynnig hwnnw—fy ngwelliant i yw e—oherwydd nid yw'n cyflawni'r hyn yr oeddwn i wedi'i obeithio. Y bwriad oedd cyflwyno rhywbeth a fyddai'n annog y Llywodraeth i ystyried rhoi gwell amddiffyniad i enwau hynafol cartrefi a ffermydd, ac yn y blaen, ond, rywsut, mae'r gwelliant wedi ymddangos ac, yn sicr, nid yw'n cyflawni ei bwrpas, felly ni fyddaf yn symud y gwelliant yna.

[115] Mae'r Bil yma, wrth gwrs, fel y mae nifer ohonom yn gwybod, yn gyfle euraidd i ni fel Cynulliad i weithredu dros y Gymraeg, i'w hamddiffyn hi ac i'w hybu hi fel iaith hyfyw. Rwy'n falch bod y Gweinidog wedi cytuno i gynnig gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3, ond, wrth gwrs, nid ydyn nhw'n ddigonol ynddynt eu hunain. Nid ydyn nhw'n ateb y galwadau a gafodd eu gwneud yn adroddiad y pwyllgor. Mae yna welliannau eraill yn adroddiad y pwyllgor, ac rwyf yn siomedig na wnaeth y Llywodraeth ymateb i'r rheini drwy welliant.

[116] Mae sefydlu cyfundrefn ar gyfer cynnal asesiadau effaith datblygiadau ar y Gymraeg yn hanfodol, wrth gwrs, er mwyn galluogi cynghorwyr a'r Arolygiaeth Gynllunio i benderfynu cefnogi neu wrthwynebu datblygiad ar sail ei effaith iaith.

[117] Rydym ni'n gwybod mai dim ond 0.03 y cant o geisiadau cynllunio oedd wedi cael eu hasesu am eu heffaith ar yr iaith Gymraeg yn ôl cais rhyddid gwybodaeth gan Gymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg yn ddiweddar. Tri awdurdod cynllunio lleol yn unig oedd hynny allan o'r 25. Rhwng 2010 a 2012, cafwyd cyfanswm o 16 asesiad allan o bron i 50,000 o geisiadau cynllunio. Mae cwestiynau yn codi, hefyd, wrth gwrs, am wrthrychedd yr asesiadau effaith iaith yma gan iddyn nhw, mewn nifer o achosion, gael eu comisiynu a'u hariannu gan y datblygwyr eu hunain, a oedd â budd amlwg yn y broses honno. Mae angen y sail dystiolaeth a gynigir gan asesiad effaith iaith annibynnol er mwyn galluogi cynghorwyr i wrthod neu ganiatáu cais, fel yr oeddwn i'n ei ddweud, ar sail ei effaith ar yr iaith. Rwy'n falch iawn, felly, i fedru cefnogi gwelliannau 125 a 114.

[118] Mae gwelliant 72 hefyd yn hynod o

with the exception of amendment 156. I won't be moving that—it's in my name—because it doesn't achieve what I had hope it would. The intention was to introduce something that would encourage the Government to provide greater protection for the ancient names of homes and farms, and so on, but, somehow, the amendment has appeared and it certainly doesn't achieve its purpose, so I won't move that amendment.

This Bill, of course, as many of us know, is a golden opportunity for us as an Assembly to take action for the Welsh language, to protect and promote it as a viable community language. I am pleased that the Minister has agreed to move amendments 1, 2 and 3, but, of course, they are not sufficient in and of themselves. They do not meet the demands made in the committee report. There are other amendments in the committee report, and I'm disappointed that the Government didn't respond to those using amendments.

The establishment of a system for holding language impact assessments is crucial, of course, in order to enable councillors and the Planning Inspectorate to decide to support or reject a development on the basis of its impact on the language.

We know that only 0.03 per cent of planning applications were actually assessed in terms of their impact on the Welsh language, according to a freedom of information request from the Welsh Language Society recently. That is only three local planning authorities from 25. Between 2010 and 2012, there were only 16 assessments from nearly 50,000 planning applications. It begs the question as to the subjectivity of the language impact assessments, because, in a number of cases, they were commissioned and paid for by the developers themselves, who clearly had an interest in that process. We need that evidence base provided by Welsh language impact assessments in order to enable councillors to accept or reject an application on the basis of its impact on the language. I'm very pleased, therefore, to be able to support amendments 125 and 114.

Amendment 72 is also very important. Many

bwysig. Mae nifer o'r asesiadau effaith iaith yn cael eu hariannu gan ddatblygwyr, fel yr oeddwn i'n ei ddweud, ar hyn o bryd. Felly, mae angen llais annibynnol i edrych ar sut mae asesiadau yn cael eu cynnal. Mae Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin wedi gofyn am arweiniad cenedlaethol o ran methodoleg yn ei adroddiad, 'Y Gymraeg yn Sir Gâr', a gyhoeddwyd gan weithgor o'r cyngor sir ym mis Mawrth y llynedd. Drwy roi rôl ffurfiol i Gomisiynydd y Gymraeg mewn asesu effeithlonrwydd yr asesiadau effaith yma, byddai modd, hefyd, wrth gwrs, sicrhau cysondeb.

[119] Nawr, mae fy ngwelliant i fan hyn, gwelliant 190, yn bodloni argymhelliad 7 o adroddiad y pwyllgor ar ddiwedd Cyfnod 1, sef i gyflwyno gwelliant i adran 70 o Ddeddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 i'w gwneud yn glir i bawb sy'n ymwneud â chynllunio y caiff penderfynwyr roi sylw i'r effaith ar y Gymraeg i'r graddau y bydd yn berthnasol i'r cais. Byddai'n golygu bod gan gynghorwyr y grym i ganiatáu neu wrthod datblygiadau ar sail eu heffaith ar y Gymraeg er mwyn osgoi problemau fel rydym ni wedi'u gweld yn codi mewn enghreifftiau o sir Gaerfyrddin i sir Fôn.

[120] Nid yw'r gwelliant yn newid faint o bwys sy'n cael ei roi i'r Gymraeg. Yr hyn y mae'n ei wneud yw sicrhau bod gan gynghorwyr rym i ystyried y Gymraeg wrth wneud penderfyniad os ydyn nhw'n dymuno gwneud hynny. Nid yw'n rhoi unrhyw statws arbennig i'r Gymraeg, dim ond yn ei rhoi ar yr un lefel ag ystyriaethau eraill. Mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig, rwy'n meddwl, oherwydd rwy'n ofni weithiau fod yna gamddealltwriaeth yn y drafodaeth o gwmpas y materion yma. Nid goruchafiaeth i'r Gymraeg uwchlaw pob dim arall yw'r bwriad, ond cyfartaledd â'r Gymraeg ochr yn ochr ag ystyriaethau eraill. Dyna, wrth gwrs, alwad y lluoedd o arweinyddion ac aelodau cynghorau sir o bob rhan o Gymru ac o bob lliw gwleidyddol, a ysgrifennodd at y Llywodraeth yn ddiweddar yn gofyn am hyn. Mae e hefyd yn destun llythyr gan arweinydd Llafur Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin cwpwl o fisoedd yn ôl yn gwneud yr un pwynt. Felly, fel rwy'n ei ddweud, mae'n siomedig nad yw'r Llywodraeth efallai wedi ymateb yn fwy positif i'r holl argymhellion a oedd yn

of the language impact assessments are funded by developers at present, as I said. So, we need an independent voice to look at how assessments are conducted. Carmarthenshire County Council has asked for national guidance in terms of methodology in its report, 'The Welsh Language in Carmarthenshire', published by a working group from the council in March of last year. By giving a formal role to the Welsh Language Commissioner in assessing the efficiency of these impact assessments, it would also be possible to ensure consistency.

Now, my amendment here, amendment 190, actually fulfils recommendation 7 of the committee's report at the end of Stage 1, namely to include an amendment to section 70 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 to make it clear to everyone working in planning that decision makers may consider the impact on the Welsh language to the extent it is relevant to the application. It would mean that councillors have the power to accept or reject applications on the basis of their impact on the Welsh language to avoid problems such as those we've seen in examples from Carmarthenshire to Anglesey.

The amendment doesn't change how much emphasis is placed on the Welsh language. What it does is ensure that councillors have the power to give consideration to the Welsh language in making their decisions, should they so wish. It doesn't confer any special status on the Welsh language, but merely gives it the same weight as other considerations. That is an important point, I think, because I do fear that there is sometimes a misunderstanding in the debate around this issue. The aim is not to give the Welsh language some supreme status over everything else, but to provide equality for the language alongside other considerations. That, of course, was the call from the many leaders and members of county councils from all parts of Wales and all political hues who wrote to the Government recently asking for this. It is also the subject of correspondence by the Labour leader of Carmarthenshire County Council a few months ago making that same point. So, as I say, it's disappointing that the Government hasn't responded more positively to all the

adroddiad y pwyllgor.

recommendations made in the committee's report.

09:45

[121] Nawr, ym mis Awst y llynedd, mi gyhoeddodd y Prif Weinidog ddogfen bolisi o'r enw 'Bwrw mlaen', ac yn y ddogfen bolisi honno gan Lywodraeth Cymru, maen nhw'n addo cymryd—ac rwy'n dyfynnu:

Now, last August, the First Minister published a policy document called 'Moving forward', and in that policy document from the Welsh Government, they pledge to take—and I quote:

[122] 'pob cam ymarferol ar gyfer atgyfnerthu'r Gymraeg o fewn y system gynllunio.'

'every practical step to strengthen the Welsh language within the planning system.'

[123] Nawr, mi fyddai derbyn y gwelliannau yma yn sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd, yn sicrhau bod Carwyn Jones, y Prif Weinidog, yn driw i'w air ac yn sicrhau bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn dangos pa mor o ddifrif ydyn nhw ynglŷn â'r iaith Gymraeg.

Now, accepting these amendments would ensure that that did happen, it would ensure that Carwyn Jones, the First Minister, remained true to his word, and it would show how seriously the Welsh Government takes the Welsh language.

[124] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Galwaf ar William Powell i siarad.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you. I call on William Powell to speak.

[125] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I speak to and move amendment 72, tabled in my name, as laid out by committee recommendation 9 in our report. We wanted to ensure that the Welsh Language Commissioner be given a formal role in assessing the quality and moderating the consistency of language impact assessments, in order to ensure that there is, indeed, consistency and a robust approach both to development plans and also major planning applications. The nature of language impact assessments as such will obviously be subject to a degree of subjectivity, but it is really important that we guard them against any suggestion that they could in some way be contaminated by the source of the funding, and that's been referred to earlier by Llyr Gruffydd in moving his amendments. By formally involving the Welsh Language Commissioner in the assessment of the quality of these impact assessments, I think we would gain that assurance, and we'd be able to minimise the possibility for divergence in that regard. It wouldn't be impossible to find a way of maybe identifying some additional resource that could be derived, ultimately, from potential developers, but that could assist maybe the Welsh Language Commissioner, because this role will not be resource neutral and will require some resource, but that needs further work, I think.

[126] Reference has already been made to the importance accorded to these matters and the status of the Welsh language, both by a range of leaders within the Welsh Local Government Association across all parties and also the correspondence from veteran Labour councillor, Councillor Kevin Madge, currently leader of Carmarthenshire council, asking for national leadership in terms of the methodology of conducting language impact assessments. I believe that the Welsh Language Commissioner is ideally placed to provide this kind of leadership and this kind of reassurance. Diolch.

[127] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Russell George i siarad.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you very much. Russell George to speak.

[128] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. I would like to speak to amendment 125 in the name of Suzy Davies. Suzy's amendment covers much of the same policy objectives as my own and those of William Powell and Llyr. Like me, she also welcomes your amendments

introducing an obligation on Welsh Ministers in the case of amendment 1, strategic planning panels in amendment 2, and local planning authorities in amendment 3. The question remains, however, as to the effect of actual planning applications on the Welsh language. It's a difficult question.

[129] As Welsh Conservatives, we accept that devising a structure that is reasonable and proportionate, and consistent yet fair across many planning authorities with completely different identities needs further consideration. The level of evidence-based policy development is simply not ready to be articulated on the face of the Bill. However, this amendment, like others, requires you to introduce regulations to compel planning authorities to carry out Welsh language impact assessments in the case of some as yet unidentified planning applications. That gives you, Minister, plenty of scope to be reasonable and proportionate, with exemptions and exclusions based on evidence, rather than random numbers and percentages.

[130] We're not looking for pointless bureaucracy, burdens on individuals who want to extend their home, but we are mindful that even the most modest development proposals could swamp an existing small settlement. So, we're also mindful that more ambitious Welsh language standards regarding promotion of the Welsh language may apply to some planning authorities, which would also need to be considered. Such regulations would take considerable development work, but that is, of course, no excuse for it not to be done. As with the other amendments on this point, Suzy is asking for planning authorities to have due regard to the findings of such an impact assessment, and the fact that planning authorities routinely ignore or pay little regard to existing guidance on this is why such an amendment is, I think, before you, Minister.

[131] I'd also like to speak to amendments 114 and 121 in my name in this grouping. I think that Bill, Llyr, Suzy and I are very much united in our desire to strengthen the Welsh language provisions in this Bill and, as, perhaps, Llyr has alluded to, the First Minister has indicated in the past that this Bill is one of the vehicles that could be, and should be, used to facilitate the progression of Government policy in this area, which is to grow the Welsh language right across Wales. Amendment 114 is to put on the face of the Bill the need for local authorities to formally carry out a Welsh impact assessment appraisal process on applications designated by Welsh Ministers through regulation. This would give Welsh impact assessments the same standard as environmental impact assessments and sustainability impact assessments, so would have to be carried out at the same time as those assessments take place, giving a fuller picture of the effect a development would have on those material considerations. So, the amendment also ensures that the Welsh Language Commissioner, and other experts on the language, are designated by Ministers and given a formal role in the consultation process before regulations are made under subsection 1, and this will ensure that the appraisal process is robust and consistent. So, I think this is a sensible amendment and it ensures equality with other assessments that currently take place. Amendment 121 is simply to ensure that the new section is inserted into section 7 to allow Welsh Ministers to make regulations and Orders under this section.

[132] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Ocê. A oes **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay. Are there other Aelodau eraill am siarad? Antoinette Members who wish to speak? Antoinette Sandbach. Sandbach.

[133] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I think it's very important, the words used by Suzy Davies, 'reasonable' and 'proportionate'. As has already been said by Russell George, a smallish development of, say, 25 to 50 houses in a rural setting in Wales can have a very big impact, whereas, for example, a development of 100 houses on the coast may have little impact in terms of language. So, I do think it's important that we have the evidence-based policy making, and particularly because we can't necessarily set an arbitrary number on when these

impact assessments should apply, and when they don't. I think the amendments that have been tabled by Suzy Davies are very important in that regard.

[134] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, Antoinette. Neb arall i siarad. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i ymateb. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you, Antoinette. There's nobody else to speak. I call on the Minister to reply to the debate.

[135] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I welcome the contributions of Members again in the discussions around this issue that I've had with stakeholders, and my team have had with stakeholders too. It's clear the Welsh language is very important to this Government and to the First Minister, who leads on Welsh language. We've a shared ambition to see the planning system do all it can that is practical and reasonable in supporting the Welsh language, and I listened to Llyr very carefully in his contribution. My amendments are aimed at the plan level, and I think there is consensus around the table that it's the best opportunity for planning to make a meaningful contribution to the wellbeing of the Welsh language, and this is an opportunity within this Bill. My amendments will ensure that the Welsh language is considered in every development plan, local and strategic, and, of course, by the Welsh Ministers in the national development framework, in that process.

[136] The non-Government amendments, it appears, all relate to the planning application level, where the combined and cumulative effect of such an application, in a development strategy, on the Welsh language are difficult to assess at that level. While, today, we will be seeking support for our Government amendments, what I'm not saying is that we won't give further consideration to the comments made by Members in committee today. I will, through discussions with Members, consider laying further amendments at Stage 3, should we so wish and need to do so, in that proposal.

[137] With regard to the final point regarding the Welsh Language Commissioner, I certainly believe there is added value to the Welsh Language Commissioner having a role to play supporting local authorities. Her role in the development and planning and explaining how TAN 20 operates to local authorities is something that we need to work with her on in this particular case, listening to a number of elected Members who have written to us on various issues, not just on Welsh language issues, and how we can support them better in interpretation and guidance around those procedures. But I'm not yet convinced of the argument of the Welsh Language Commissioner being on a statutory footing regarding planning circumstances. I would ask Members to support the Government amendments in this group today.

[138] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Cynigiaf felly welliant 1 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 1? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nid oes gwrthwynebiad, felly derbyniwyd y gwelliant. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I move amendment 1 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 1 be agreed. Does any Member object? There are no objections, therefore the amendment is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 1 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 1 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[139] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych yn dymuno cynnig gwelliant 122 yn enw Suzy Davies? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 122 in the name of Suzy Davies?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 122 (Suzy Davies)
Amendment 122 (Suzy Davies) moved.*

[140] **Russell George:** Yes.

[141] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 122? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 122 i godi'u dwylo, ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Felly, rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant. Ni dderbyniwyd y gwelliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 122 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 122, please raise your hands, and those against. As there is a tied vote, I will use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment. The amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 122: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 122: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones Ffred, Alun
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 122.
Amendment 122 not agreed.*

[142] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych yn dymuno cynnig gwelliant 137?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 137?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 137 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 137 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[143] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[144] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 137? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 137 i ddangos, ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Felly, rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 137 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We therefore proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 137, please raise your hands. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative; that is, against the amendment. The amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 137: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 137: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike

Jones Ffred, Alun
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 137.
Amendment 137 not agreed.

[145] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych yn dymuno cynnig gwelliant 138?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 138?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 138 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 138 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[146] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[147] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 138? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 138 i ddangos. Diolch yn fawr. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Felly, rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais yn erbyn y gwelliant. Ni dderbynnir y gwelliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 138 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 138, please raise your hands. And against. As there is a tied vote, I therefore use my casting vote in the negative against the amendment. The amendment is not agreed.

Gwelliant 138: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 138: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones Ffred, Alun
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 138.
Amendment 138 not agreed.

[148] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, cynnig gwelliant 139.

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 139?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 139 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 139 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[149] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[150] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 139? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 139 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Felly, ni dderbynnir y gwelliant gan fy mod yn bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 139 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 139, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative; that is, against the amendment. The amendment is not agreed.

Gwelliant 139: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 139: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones Ffred, Alun
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 139.
Amendment 139 not agreed.*

[151] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych yn dymuno cynnig gwelliant 88?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 88?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 88 (Russell George).
Amendment 88 (Russell George) moved.*

[152] **Russell George:** Yes. Move.

[153] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 88? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn at bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 88 i ddangos, ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal, felly rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Ni dderbyniwyd y gwelliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 88 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 88, please raise your hands. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative; that is, against the amendment. The amendment is not agreed.

Gwelliant 88: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 88: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones Ffred, Alun
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 88.

Amendment 88 not agreed.

[154] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych yn dymuno cynnig gwelliant 89?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 89?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 89 (Russell George).

Amendment 89 (Russell George) moved.

[155] **Russell George:** Yes. Move.

[156] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynir gwelliant 89, bydd gwelliannau 90, 49 a 91 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 89? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais felly. Pawb o blaid gwelliant 89 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Ac, felly, rwy'n defnyddio fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol yn erbyn y gwelliant. Felly, ni dderbynir gwelliant 89.

Alun Ffred Jones: If amendment 89 is agreed, amendments 90, 49 and 91 will fall. The question is that amendment 89 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote therefore. All those in favour of amendment 89, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative; that is, against the amendment. Therefore, amendment 89 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 89: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 89: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones Ffred, Alun
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 89.

Amendment 89 not agreed.

[157] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych yn dymuno cynnig gwelliant 90?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 90?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 90 (Russell George).

Amendment 90 (Russell George) moved.

[158] **Russell George:** Yes.

[159] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that

a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 90? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 90 i ddangos os gwelwch yn dda, ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Felly, rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 90.

amendment 90 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. Those in favour of amendment 90, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative; that is, against the amendment. Therefore, amendment 90 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 90: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 90: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones Ffred, Alun
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 90.
Amendment 90 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 49 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 49 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[160] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 49 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 4? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Na. Felly, derbyniwyd gwelliant 49.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 49 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 49 be agreed. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 49 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 49 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 49 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[161] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych yn dymuno cynnig gwelliant 91?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 91?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 91 (Russell George).
Amendment 91 (Russell George) moved.*

[162] **Russell George:** Move.

[163] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 91? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb o blaid gwelliant 91, os gwelwch yn dda, i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Yn gyfartal. Fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn, felly ni dderbyniwyd y gwelliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 91 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 91, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative; that is, against the amendment. Therefore, the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 91: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 91: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 91.
Amendment 91 not agreed.*

10:00

[164] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 92? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 92?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 92 (Russell George).
Amendment 92 (Russell George) moved.*

[165] **Russell George:** Move.

[166] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 92? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 92 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 92. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 92 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 92, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative; that is, against the amendment. Therefore, amendment 92 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 92: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 92: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 92.

Amendment 92 not agreed.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 50 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 50 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[167] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 50 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Derbyniwyd gwelliant 50, felly.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 50 in the name of the Minister. Is there any objection? Amendment 50 is agreed, therefore.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 50 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 50 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

Grŵp 5: Cynllunio Strategol (Gwelliannau 93, 94, 141, 142, 143, 144, 95, 96, 145, 65, 66, 146, 123, 147, 148, 67, 68, 149, 150, 51, 151, 192 a 193)

Group 5: Strategic Planning (Amendments 93, 94, 141, 142, 143, 144, 95, 96, 145, 65, 66, 146, 123, 147, 148, 67, 68, 149, 150, 51, 151, 192 and 193)

[168] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym yn symud ymlaen, felly, i grŵp 5, ar baneli cynllunio strategol, ac mae nifer o welliannau yn y grŵp yma. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 93, yn enw Russell George. Galwaf ar Russell i symud gwelliant 93 a siarad am ei welliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: We move, therefore, to group 5, on strategic planning panels, and there are a number of amendments in this group. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 93, in the name of Russell George. I call on Russell to move 93 and speak to his amendment.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 93 (Russell George).
Amendment 93 (Russell George) moved.*

[169] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair; I move amendments 93, 94, 95 and 96 in this group. The rationale behind these amendments is my desire to simplify Part 2 of the Bill. From the evidence we received at Stage 1, there were concerns about how complex the proposed new developments are for development planning, and that the Bill, as drafted, was too top-down in structure. I agreed with many of the witnesses who felt that local democracy could well be compromised by the new architecture, and that it would make it even more difficult to achieve community engagement in the planning system. The argument for the need for a national development framework as a new national development plan for Wales is robust, and I agree with this principle. However, what are not compelling, to me, are the arguments for the proposed tiers that sit underneath it. The introduction of a new strategic development plan is, in my opinion, introducing a complex and totally unnecessary level of development management; therefore, my proposal with amendment 93, and the subsequent amendments, is to remove the strategic development plan tier completely from the Bill, and, instead, replace it with a statutory duty to co-operate. So, I believe that, after local government reorganisation, there will be, naturally, collaboration over large regional areas, both rural and urban, so the approach needs to be less rigid, in a structural sense, and more flexible and pragmatic.

[170] One of the points raised by the independent advisory group in its report was to improve and enhance the way that statutory consultees interact with the planning system. Placing a duty on stakeholders in this way to contribute positively to the efficient and effective functioning of the system, I think, achieves that independent advisory group objective, but it also contributes to the core of the Government's desired outcome, which is to enable a positive cultural step change across the entire planning system.

[171] The effect of amendments 94 to 96 is to remove the more substantial sections of the

Bill that relate to strategic development plans. If the proposed amendments are accepted, then there will, of course, need to be changes at Stage 3 to tidy up the legislation and remove all of the consequential at that stage.

[172] I would also like to move amendment 123 in the name of Suzy Davies. Amendment 123 simply requires Ministers to include that appraisal in one of the considerations on the list that attracts the due-regard duty under section 60I(6). Again, I argue that there is no point asking for an appraisal if no-one is obliged, unequivocally, to give it due regard in the relevant decision-making process.

[173] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. I call on Llyr Llyr Gruffydd i siarad? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gruffydd to speak.

[174] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Thank you, Chair. I move amendments 141 through to 151, and amendments 192 and 193. I'll be supporting all of the amendments in this group, although my hope is that, maybe, I won't need to, because the most important amendments here, of course, are those to take out the whole tier of strategic development plans from the Bill. I recognise, of course, the need for some form of regional planning, but creating a whole new statutory layer and a new tier of bureaucracy, I believe, is unnecessary and goes against the grain of bringing decision making closer to the people. Given also that we know that local government reorganisation is in the offing and that we will have fewer and larger local planning authorities, they will therefore become more regional and strategic in nature, and I believe that allowing joint plans between two or three of these larger planning authorities and establishing a duty to co-operate, of course, is preferable to creating a whole new layer of development plans, in my view. Now, my preference, as I said, is to remove the SDPs but, of course, if they are to remain, there need to be changes as well and those are reflected in some of my amendments in this group.

[175] Later on, I'll be seeking to remove all references to nominated members, for example, on the strategic planning panels. Taking decisions further up the chain away from communities is one thing, but taking it away or at least undermining democratic accountability is another. Whilst I welcome the fact that the Minister has conceded on voting rights for nominated members, these unelected individuals, of course, could and would still have a great deal of influence on decision making and indeed considerable vested interests. I've also tabled amendments that seek to reduce the influence of these unelected members through increasing, for example, the proportion of local planning authority members, and I very much hope that committee will support the lead amendment and protect communities against this transfer of power away from democratically accountable bodies or, at the very least, support my amendments to limit that shift of power.

[176] I also have amendments to ensure that communities and the people who are important to those communities have a say in the process of creating strategic development plans. Amendment 142 refers specifically to giving community councils a greater say and ensures consultation with them in the SDP process. Amendment 143 again places a duty to have regard to socioeconomic disadvantage in decision making at the SDP level, which is something we touched on earlier. Amendment 145 removes a specified expiry date for the SDP, in the same vein as proposed earlier by me for the NDF. Amendment 147 references the need to tackle climate change, a point again that I made earlier, but this time it's in the context of the strategic development plan.

[177] Amendment 193 ensures that Ministers cannot create SDPs before 2021. Now, given that the Bill, as it was introduced, requires local development plans to conform to strategic development plans and the national development framework, we'll find ourselves in a situation where we have to have three statutory development plans in conformity with each other, applying to one area, in a country of 3 million people and implemented by three

different types of authority in various configurations. Now, an LDP may have to change when the NDF comes in and then change again when the SDP comes in, and this level of uncertainty isn't in anyone's interests. It undermines, I believe, public trust in the planning system and is needlessly confusing. Similar provisions in England had serious implications, and we can and we should learn lessons from that.

[178] Amendments 149, 150 and 151 are aimed at tackling the same problem. Amendment 149 particularly, for example, gives five years for development plans to conform to the national development framework, and amendment 150 removes the requirement for local planning authorities to review their LDPs once an SDP comes into force. The LDP should be taken into account by the SDP and not the other way round, again coming back to the bottom-up approach.

[179] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. William Powell.

[180] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I speak to and move amendments 65, 66, 67 and 68 tabled in my name. As I said earlier in speaking to our amendment in group 3, these amendments are principally intended to establish a clear and transparent link between statutory national and regional transport planning arrangements, which we feel would be beneficial to the effective running of the national development framework and indeed to the strategic development plans. Both amendments are relevant to the SDP. As I said earlier with reference to amendments 63 and 64, this amendment, along with amendment 68 in this group, is intended to ensure that terrestrial and marine planning are closely aligned and put on the same footing. It is high time that we moved away from the habit that we've had over a long period of having a sort of add-on consideration of marine issues. We need to ensure that they are both on a similar footing and given due weight, which is really important for an effective planning system and one that is joined up. I shall be supporting the vast majority, if not all, of the amendments in this group and I associate myself very much with the remarks regarding accountability, democracy and the bottom-up approach that has been supported by colleagues on this side of the table.

[181] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes Aelodau **Alun Ffred Jones:** Are there other Members eraill sydd eisiau siarad? Antoinette. who wish to speak? Antoinette.

[182] **Antoinette Sandbach:** I think these amendments are really important, particularly the amendments spoken to by Russell George and Llyr Huws Gruffydd. It is clear that we are rapidly getting a whole new architecture in Wales of boards, and yesterday we enacted legislation that will create public service boards. These proposed SDPs will, in effect, remove decision making from local people. It takes that localism, that accountability, that input, that buy-in—that community buy-in that I thought we were supposed to be guaranteeing via the future generations Bill—away from local people, and it's my view that, with the reforms that are potentially coming through anyway in relation to the Williams commission and again in relation to the legislation that was passed yesterday, it sends out the wrong message to take that buy-in from local communities and that ability to feed into the process. I very much associate myself with what Llyr Huws Gruffydd has said about the fact that there is likely to be co-operation anyway. Minister, you can shake your head, but we just yesterday enacted an architecture around public service boards, which is going to require that co-operation between local authorities in terms of planning for the future. Now, it will require it in respect of the wellbeing goals, including sustainable development, and it's my view that there shouldn't be this rigid structure. That flexibility that Russell George has argued for is incredibly important.

[183] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Jenny Rathbone.

[184] **Jenny Rathbone:** Amendment 93 seems to suggest that we need to be collaborating with adjacent planning authorities. It doesn't specify that they have to be Welsh authorities.

So, we could be, if this amendment were passed, tying ourselves in to the unpredictability of the English planning system, which we have no control over. Amendment 142 puts community councils on a pedestal that I don't think they deserve. Some of them are very good and others are unelected and it's just the same-old, same-old people who know how to say 'no' who are on these. So I think that, where they're working well, they obviously need to be given appropriate consideration, but I don't think there should be an obligation on the face of the Bill to consult every single community council, which may have nothing particular to say about a particular planning matter.

[185] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Thank you.

[186] Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad. I call on the Minister to speak.

[187] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. First of all, I would seek for you to move amendment 51 in this group in my name. Amendment 51 ensures consistency with local development plans, with strategic development plans being adopted or approved rather than published. Chair, I'm slightly surprised by some of the comments that have been made on this group. I know that you particularly work up your considerations based on evidence provided to this committee, and certainly we as Government take very clearly your committee report to be paramount in terms of making our decisions on amendments moving forward. Can I therefore quote page 43 of your committee report? I believe that the same Members, apart from Mike Hedges, were on this committee at that stage. It says:

[188] 'On balance, we conclude that an SDP could prove to be a useful option in some parts of Wales, particularly the south east and we are therefore broadly supportive of the provisions in the Bill that allow for their creation.'

[189] That is the evidence that you provided to me. I have made amendments to this Bill and therefore now it seems to me that the wrecking amendments that have been tabled to remove them completely fly in the face of your committee report. However, we will continue to seek to move on that procedure. I think we will just have to agree to disagree as the evidence that you provided to me has now changed.

10:15

[190] The issue that Russell George raised with regard to the duty to co-operate has led to the complete downfall of the system in England, as recognised and as has been raised in concerns to me and, I assume, to you as committee members by the Home Builders Federation and the Royal Town Planning Institute. Therefore, I support their principle that the co-operation model wouldn't work and wouldn't be appropriate for Wales; again, based on evidence.

[191] The issue of democratic deficit is also one I do not recognise, either. Only elected members will have voting rights; again, as presented to me by you in the committee report, we've removed the issue of unelected members having voting rights. We've acted appropriately regarding the committee's recommendations, but it seems to me slightly odd that, now, we have a report that says one thing and the majority of the committee suggesting something different to the report's suggestions to me.

[192] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Thank you for quoting the report. There are other areas in the report that, obviously, you have studiously ignored as well, but we'll let that be. Okay.

[193] Russell, a hoffech chi symud i Russell, do you wish to proceed to a vote on bleidlais ar welliant 93? amendment 93?

[194] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. I would reiterate that last point that you made, Chair—

[195] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Sorry—.

[196] **Russell George:** Thank you. I strongly agree with the points that have been made by Bill Powell, Llyr and my colleague Antoinette. I don't recognise the point Jenny Rathbone made with regard to amendment 93. I'm disappointed by your response, but not surprised, I suppose. Despite what you said with regard to the report, I think it was clear from a significant proportion of both the oral and written evidence that we received at Stage 1 that there are real and legitimate concerns regarding the design of the development plan architecture as has been proposed in the Bill as introduced. I understand the points that the independent advisory group made on current arrangements for cross-border boundary issues being fragmented and lacking clarity, and I agree with that analysis. However, John Davies made his recommendations 10 months before the Williams commission was even established, and the landscape has changed significantly. There will, naturally, be collaboration over large regional areas, and that includes rural areas, because economic development and growth are not strategic objectives that are, or should be, purely aligned to larger urban and well-populated areas of Wales. Also, the LDP process would have to be redefined when it happens; that's a fact. If the Minister has concerns about collaborative working, then what I've suggested in the way of a statutory duty to collaborate in amendment 93 would, of course, provide you with a more flexible and pragmatic argument, which would create a system that would fit the purpose, in my view, better than a new development tier.

[197] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, Russell. Sorri am hynny. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you, Russell. Sorry about that.

[198] Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno symud i bleidlais ar welliant 93? Russell, do you wish to proceed to vote on amendment 93?

[199] **Russell George:** Yes.

[200] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 93? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais, felly. Y rhai sydd o blaid gwelliant 93 i ddangos drwy godi eich dwylo. Diolch yn fawr. Yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal, felly mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol—yn erbyn y gwelliant. Felly, ni dderbynnir y gwelliant. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 93 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. Those in favour of amendment 93, please indicate by raising your hands. Thank you. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative; that is, against the amendment. Therefore, the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 93: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 93: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â

Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 93.
Amendment 93 not agreed.*

[201] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 94?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 94?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 94 (Russell George).
Amendment 94 (Russell George) moved.*

[202] **Russell George:** Yes, move.

[203] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynnir gwelliant 94, bydd gwelliannau 141 i 144 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 94? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Cyfartal—felly mae'r bleidlais fwrw'n mynd yn negyddol. Felly ni dderbynnir y gwelliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: If amendment 94 is agreed, amendments 141 to 144 fall. The question is that amendment 94 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote, therefore. All those in favour, please raise your hands. Against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 94: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 94: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 94.
Amendment 94 not agreed.*

[204] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 141?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 141?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 141 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 141 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[205] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[206] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 141? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 141 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to

bleidlais. Rheini sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Yn erbyn. Rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 141.

a vote. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Those against. I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 141 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 141: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 141: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 141.
Amendment 141 not agreed.*

[207] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 142?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 142?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 142 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 142 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[208] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[209] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 142? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 142 i godi eu dwylo. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae hynny'n gyfartal, ac felly, mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn mynd yn negyddol ac ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 142.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 142 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. All in favour of amendment 142, please raise your hands. And, against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 142 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 142: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 142: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 142.
Amendment 142 not agreed.*

[210] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 143?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 143?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 143 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 143 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[211] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[212] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 143? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 143 i godi eu dwylo. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal, felly, mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 143.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 143 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 143, please raise your hands. And, against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 143 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 143: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 143: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 143.
Amendment 143 not agreed.*

[213] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 144?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 144?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 144 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 144 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[214] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[215] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 144? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb o blaid gwelliant 144 i ddangos. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal, felly, mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 144.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 144 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 144, please indicate. And, against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 144 is not

agreed.

*Gwelliant 144: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 144: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 144.
Amendment 144 not agreed.*

[216] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 95? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 95?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 95 (Russell George).
Amendment 95 (Russell George) moved.*

[217] **Russell George:** Move.

[218] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 95? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 95. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 95 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. All in favour, please raise your hands. And, against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 95 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 95: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 95: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 95.
Amendment 95 not agreed.*

[219] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 96?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 96?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 96 (Russell George).
Amendment 96 (Russell George) moved.*

[220] **Russell George:** Yes, move.

[221] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynir gwelliant 96, bydd gwelliannau 145, 65, 66, 146, 123, 147, 2, 148, 67 a 68 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 96? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 96.

Alun Ffred Jones: If amendment 96 is agreed, amendment 145, 65, 66, 146, 123, 147, 2, 148, 67 and 68 fall. The question is that amendment 96 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All in favour, please raise your hands. And, against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore amendment 96 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 96: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 96: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 96.
Amendment 96 not agreed.*

[222] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 145?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 145?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 145 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 145 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[223] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[224] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 145? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo—145. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 145.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 145 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of 145, please raise your hands. And, against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 145 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 145: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 145: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 145.
Amendment 145 not agreed.*

[225] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 65? **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 65?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 65 (William Powell).
Amendment 65 (William Powell) moved.*

[226] **William Powell:** Move.

[227] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 65? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 65. Pawb o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 65. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 65 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote on amendment 65. All in favour, please raise your hands. And, against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 65 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 65: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 65: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 65.
Amendment 65 not agreed.*

[228] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 66? **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 66?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 66 (William Powell).
Amendment 66 (William Powell) moved.

[229] **William Powell:** Move.

[230] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 66. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 66 i godi eu dwylo. Ac, yn erbyn. Pleidlais gyfartal, felly mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 66.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 66 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 66, please raise your hands. And, against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 66 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 66: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 66: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 66.
Amendment 66 not agreed.

[231] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 146?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 146?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 146 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 146 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[232] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[233] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 146? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 146 i godi eu dwylo. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 146.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 146 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 146, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 146 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 146: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 146: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:

Yn erbyn:

Ymatal:

For:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Against:

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Abstain:

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 146.

Amendment 146 not agreed.

[234] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 123 yn enw Suzy Davies?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 123 in the name of Suzy Davies?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 123 (Suzy Davies).

Amendment 123 (Suzy Davies) moved.

[235] **Russell George:** Yes, move.

[236] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 123. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo—gwelliant 123. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 123.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 123 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. Therefore, all in favour, please raise your hands—amendment 123. And, against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 123 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 123: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 123: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:

For:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Yn erbyn:

Against:

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Ymatal:

Abstain:

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 123.

Amendment 123 not agreed.

[237] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 147?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 147?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 147 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 147 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[238] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[239] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 147? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 147 i godi eu dwylo. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 147.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 147 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 147, please raise your hands. And, against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 147 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 147: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 147: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 147.
Amendment 147 not agreed.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 2 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 2 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[240] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 2 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 2 in the name of the Minister.

[241] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 2? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Nac oes. Derbyniwyd yr ail welliant.

The question is that amendment 2 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No. The second amendment is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 2 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 2 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

[242] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 148?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 148?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 148 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 148 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[243] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[244] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes unrhyw

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that

wrthwynebiad? Sorri. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 148? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 148 i godi eu dwylo. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 148.

amendment 148 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 148, please raise your hands. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 148 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 148: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 148: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 148.
Amendment 148 not agreed.*

[245] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 67?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 67?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 67 (William Powell).
Amendment 67 (William Powell) moved.*

[246] **William Powell:** Move.

[247] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 67. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb o blaid gwelliant 67 i godi eu dwylo. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal, felly, pleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 67.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 67 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 67, please raise your hands. And, against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore amendment 67 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 67: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 67: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â

Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 67.

Amendment 67 not agreed.

[248] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, amendment 68. gwelliant 68.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 68 (William Powell).

Amendment 68 (William Powell) moved.

[249] **William Powell:** Move.

[250] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 68. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 68. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal, felly, pleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 68.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 68 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 68. All those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, therefore amendment 68 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 68: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 68: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 68.

Amendment 68 not agreed.

[251] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 149? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 149?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 149 (Llyr Gruffydd).

Amendment 149 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[252] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[253] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 149? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 149 i godi eu dwylo. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal, **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 149 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 149, please raise your hands. And, against.

felly, pleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 149. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 149 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 149: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 149: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 149.
Amendment 149 not agreed.*

[254] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 150? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 150?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 150 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 150 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[255] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[256] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynnir gwelliant 150, bydd gwelliant 51 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 150? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 150 i ddangos. Diolch yn fawr. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal, felly, pleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 150. **Alun Ffred Jones:** If amendment 150 is agreed, amendment 51 falls. The question is that amendment 150 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 150, please indicate. Thank you. And, against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore amendment 150 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 150: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 150: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 150.
Amendment 150 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 51 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 51 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[257] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 51 yn enw'r Gweinidog. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 51 in the name of the Minister.

[258] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 51? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Felly, derbyniwyd gwelliant 51. The question is that amendment 51 be agreed to. Does any Member object? Therefore, amendment 51 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 51 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 51 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[259] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 151? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 151?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 151 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 151 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[260] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[261] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 151? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 151 i ddangos. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal, felly, pleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 151. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 151 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 151, please indicate. And, against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore amendment 151 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 151: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 151: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 151.
Amendment 151 not agreed.*

[262] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A dyna ddiwedd grŵp 5. Mae bron yn 10.30 a.m. felly rwy'n **Alun Ffred Jones:** That is the end of group 5. It is nearly 10.30 a.m. so I suggest that we

awgrymu ein bod ni'n cael toriad byr a have a short break; we will come back in 10 minutes to deal with the amendments in group 6. Come back promptly, please. Thank you.

byddwn yn ôl mewn 10 munud i ddelio efo'r gwelliannau yng ngrŵp 6. Byddwch yn ôl yn brydlon, os gwelwch yn dda. Diolch yn fawr iawn.

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 10:27 a 10:37.
The meeting adjourned between 10:27 and 10:37.*

Grŵp 6: Cynnwys y Gymuned (Gwelliannau 69, 98, 113, 78, 115 a 191)
Group 6: Community Involvement (Amendments 69, 98, 113, 78, 115 and 191)

[263] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Fe wnawn ni ailgynnull y pwyllgor a symud ymlaen i grŵp 6. Cynnwys y gymuned ydy thema'r grŵp yma—gwelliannau 69 i fyny i 191. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 69 yn enw William Powell. Galwaf ar William Powell i gynnig gwelliant 69 ac i siarad am ei welliant a'r gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp hwn.

Alun Ffred Jones: Right. We reconvene the committee and move on to group 6. The theme of this group is community involvement—amendments 69 up to 191. The main amendment in the group is amendment 69 in the name of William Powell. I call on William Powell to move amendment 69 and to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in this group.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 69 (William Powell).
Amendment 69 (William Powell) moved.*

[264] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I speak to and move amendments 69 and 78 as well in this group. It is really important, as has already been stated, that this Bill doesn't result in local communities across Wales being further removed from the plan-making process. In order to avoid that, it is our view that place plans must have a formal role as the underlying building blocks for the creation of the wider, overarching development plan. Place plans that identify the infrastructure, and indeed also the investment needs within each community, could greatly add value to the planning process if given formal status under the development plan. Place plans are all about getting local communities engaged in the planning process and doing so at an early stage. It's our view that they also help councils, be it town and community councils, but also the planning authorities in their respective cases, and also developers as well—that's important—to understand local priorities and to ensure that resources can be appropriately targeted. In this sense, they would also provide additional status to the bottom-up, community-based form of planning that we have sought to advocate here and elsewhere, and is something that I feel would give greater strength to this Bill. I believe that our amendment addresses this.

[265] Also, in terms of amendment 78, I believe that there is a strong case for introducing a limited and focused community right of appeal, focusing on those cases that give greatest cause for concern. We've expended quite a lot of energy around village greens within this committee, and rightly so, and I feel that this amendment actually draws on the same principles of protecting communities and specific interests. Clearly, we must avoid situations where planning authorities are undermined by the opening up of their decisions to further review without due cause. Nor should there be unnecessary delays to development. However, enabling a community right of appeal is all about promoting democracy and accountability and also encouraging communities and individuals to take an active and full part in planning decisions locally that will impact upon them and their quality of life.

[266] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Russell George i siarad.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you very much. Russell George to speak.

[267] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. I am very pleased to move amendments 98, 113 and 115 in this grouping. This is one of the areas I would like to see radically alter in our current planning system. How can the power of local communities be enhanced so that they feel more in control of the development that happens in and around places where they live and call home? I do not think that adequate consideration is given to the role of communities—the ordinary people who are affected by developments. The perception at local level is that it remains a system that is out of kilter and one that favours developers. When we debated the independent advisory group report in Plenary back in September 2012, the Minister's predecessor—very different from him, I know, as he's mentioned—stated that he wanted to enact real change with this piece of legislation and create a planning system that was fair for all parties involved in the process. Unfortunately, what we've seen in the draft as introduced by the Government is very little in the way of positive solutions to enable and empower communities.

[268] Now, the Minister may say in his defence that those issues will be addressed in planned local government legislation. However, the planning system is a delivery mechanism with applications across several ministerial portfolios, and co-ordinated action, I think, is needed at all levels if Welsh Government is to achieve its ambitions for economic growth, sustainability and the health and wellbeing of its citizens. Across the border, I believe we have seen a positive template for a joined-up approach, and that's the Localism Act 2011. Now, a number of provisions of that Act have been delegated to Welsh Ministers on issues like community asset transfer, community right to buy and community right to reclaim land, but the Welsh Government has decided not to take this approach and enact those powers, yet the independent advisory group report highlighted the fact that the introduction of a local planning tier in the Localism Act represented a significant stage for the evolution of a distinct planning system here in Wales. The establishment of neighbourhood planning was seen as a radical and beneficial departure from the previous top-down system in England.

[269] Members may think that, from my amendment 98, the drafting of that amendment is just advocating a direct read-across from England. That's not the case. I think it's important that we shape our own planning model here in Wales, and, if the Minister is willing to give this concept some further consideration and give me an assurance that he will bring forward a Government amendment at Stage 3 on this, I will, of course, consider withdrawing this amendment. However, as a principle, I think it's worth including on the face of the Bill, as I believe that it will act as a glue that binds together the LDP and place plan tiers of planning development, ensuring that local voices are heard louder and clearer in the future planning process.

[270] Amendment 113 relates to the national delegation scheme, which, essentially, was recommendation 33 made at Stage 1. The Minister's response to this recommendation in his letter of 26 February was a bit of a fudge, I think, considering the specific consultation he referred to closed in January. If he wanted the analysis of responses done on this point, that could have been done and he could've provided the necessary reassurances. He may still be able to do that. I obviously look forward to his response on that point.

[271] Finally, recommendation 115 is, in effect, a proposal to establish a mechanism for limited third-party right of appeal. Many people have been disappointed that the Government has not accepted the idea of appeal by third parties and that, as a consequence, it has regrettably omitted it from the current Bill. It seems very unfair to me and many other people, including a number of leading non-governmental organisations in Wales tasked with protecting our environment and landscape, that communities are not afforded similar but limited rights to private interests in terms of ability to appeal on matters of public interest. Now, as I said previously, the system, I think, is out of kilter, with the odds stacked in favour of the developer, and, while a developer who has been unsuccessful in an application, for example, has a right of appeal, communities do not, and that, I think, is unjust and

undemocratic, so I think that should change.

[272] What I am proposing here is an amendment that would introduce a limited community right of appeal process, triggered from the grass roots, which will focus on those cases that give greater grounds for concern in respect of the quality, transparency and accountability of the relevant planning decisions. We, of course, must recognise that circumstances when this provision should be permissible must be strictly regulated so that delays to development or an increase in financial risk to the investors do not occur without good cause. However, there is a strong case, I think, for the principle. Government at various tiers are encouraging communities and individuals to take a more active role in all decisions that shape their surroundings by actively engaging in different parts of the local planning system that affect their interests. So, is it not right, therefore, that, in return for those efforts, they should be repaid by sounder and more informed plan-led policies and, in most instances, by development decisions that accord with them?

[273] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I call Llyr Gruffydd to speak.

[274] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Thank you, Chair, and I'll be supporting amendments 69, 113 and 191 in this group but opposing amendments 98, 78 and 115. My view, as you should know by now, is that we need a bottom-up approach to planning, which is why I'll be supporting amendment 69 to give place plans development plan status. In anticipation of the Minister maybe suggesting that we were keen to take out one tier of development planning and introducing another, the Government's made it clear that they will not be withdrawing the regional, strategic level of development planning. So, I do feel that it's for a purpose, therefore, that we would like to see the place plans given that status, because that is one way of counteracting, I believe, the shift that we're seeing in this Bill of power moving up the chain and decisions being taken further away from communities. I don't agree with the comments of Jenny Rathbone earlier around town and community councils. Yes, they do have their challenges, but they are the level of government we have in this country that is closest to our communities and I believe that they could play a key role in that respect, even if they cluster and come together where there are capacity issues.

[275] I'll be opposing amendment 98, because of the lessons learned over the border in England, actually. Planning costs time and expertise, so neighbourhood plans in England are generally created by more affluent communities who have access to those resources. There's a definite correlation between affluence and the number of neighbourhood plans, and that was evidence that we received as a committee a while ago. Now, there may be merit in the principle, but I think that the practical application isn't great and we shouldn't slavishly follow it. Although I support the principle behind both amendment 78 and amendment 115 on community rights of appeal—of course I do—I believe that the wording in my amendment 191 is stronger, and since, if we do pass 78 or 115, my amendment will fall, then, obviously, I'll be voting against and urging other Members to do so as well.

[276] Richard Harwood QC commented that the Planning (Wales) Bill had the effect of introducing, and I quote:

[277] 'a degree of ministerial control which is unprecedented in England and Wales'.

[278] I believe that the Bill goes against some of the recommendations of the independent advisory group in the need to bring decision making closer to the people, and it apes the proposals made by the Tories in England, which were not evidence-based. The right of appeal for communities therefore goes some way in redressing that balance, which also, as it stands, I believe is too heavily in favour of developers.

[279] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Unrhyw Aelod arall yn dymuno siarad? Mike Hedges. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Are there other Members who wish to speak? Mike Hedges.

[280] **Mike Hedges:** I haven't served on a planning committee for some time, but my understanding of the planning system when I was involved in it is that you could make a legal challenge as a community, or as an individual, and you could go to judicial review. Have those abilities to have legal challenge to judicial review gone?

[281] **Alun Ffred Jones:** That's not an appropriate place to ask that question, I don't think.

[282] **Mike Hedges:** I think it is.

[283] **Alun Ffred Jones:** If you want an answer, the answer is—

[284] **Ms Salkeld:** No.

[285] **Joyce Watson:** Chair?

[286] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Yes, Joyce.

[287] **Joyce Watson:** Thank you, Chair. I'd like to speak on the issue of equity. The issue here is on amendment 78. I'll have to find it, because they're all over the place here. Anyway, the argument is that, if we're going to move towards giving access to objecting to a planning application, we have to do it equally. My concern with some of the amendments here is that there aren't community or town councils covering all of Wales. In that respect, it would be an inequitable process that is being proposed. Obviously, I do regard quite highly the people who do sit on local and town councils, because they do so voluntarily. It might not be an exact process, but nonetheless I do agree with the comments that were just made in favour of those individuals and those councils. So, I cannot, therefore, support amendment 78 and some of the other amendments to this Bill. They have, as far as I'm concerned, been addressed by the Government in the pre-application process where community consultation for large planning applications can happen, and there is, therefore, an enhanced role for town and community councils in planning matters. I welcome that as a move forward.

[288] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I call on the Minister to speak.

[289] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. We will not be seeking to support the amendments in this group. However, I do recognise the principles set out by Members this morning. While I accept the principles, I just don't think that the route to how they wish to implement them is something that I can support, and there are some examples, which I'll allude to now.

[290] In regard to William Powell's amendment 69 in regard to place plans, if I follow the logic of criticism earlier by committee members regarding additional layers of planning structures, this indeed adds an additional structure to that plan instead of the three, which are quite clearly strategically developed. This adds another completely new system to the burden, as Members would put it, of development. Therefore, I wouldn't encourage that. What I would encourage is a process of supplementary planning guidance, where I think we can develop a better relationship in terms of how communities are engaged with the development of plans. We are seeing one in my own local authority, in Mold Town Council. They already have a process in place where they are developing with the local authority about their place plans and how that is worked, on a voluntary basis. But we will seek to support that through some supplementary planning guidance.

[291] In regard to other areas that Members have raised, again, on the issues of the consultation that Russell George alluded to, the Member has many varying opinions on consultation. I think it's a rather unfair criticism. We went out to consultation and had less than 26 days to fully analyse the consultation responses and draw conclusions from that. Now, if I accept his concerns around that—you know, I will look at that very carefully, but I hope that the Member will also use the same amount of pressure on the UK Government on an inquiry that's happening in his constituency on a windfarm development. I think that would only be fair if the criticism that's laid at this Government were laid equally in another area.

[292] I see that the issue of using other tools, as well—regarding guidance and how we build the relationship between local development orders and local development place plans—is and can be confusing, but I will seek to see how we can do that with additional guidance through the passage of this Bill. But it isn't something that we believe should be on the face of the Bill at this time.

[293] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Galwaf ar William Powell i ymateb i'r ddadl. [294] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I call on William Powell to reply to the debate.

[295] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I'm grateful to Members for their contributions and also for indications of support from my colleagues on this side. I'm disappointed by the Minister declining to offer support, particularly, to the amendments that are tabled in my name. I'm very pleased to have had a warmer appraisal of the role of town and community councils from Joyce Watson. Although we've heard what the Minister has said, I think, in the spirit of being helpful, Joyce, if you would be prepared to assist us and work maybe with the Minister to seek ways of addressing this issue that you see in terms of there being an inconsistency with those areas that don't currently have town and community council coverage, then I'm sure that we could find ways of addressing that issue. I sense, in terms of issues around third-party right of appeal, that you obviously don't have the discomfort that maybe would be implied by you voting this amendment down. If we're serious about this, and if you and your fellow troops could come behind a refined proposal, then, potentially, at the next stage, we could seek a way of doing that. I think that the intervention from Mike Hedges actually illustrates the importance of the case for there being some limited third-party right of appeal, because the judicial review process is available. But it is hugely prohibitive in terms of expense and is very much the preserve of groups of retired *The Daily Telegraph* readers who have a certain amount of resource behind them to actually get under way and bring that forward. It isn't something that's available to ordinary people out there. That is exactly the spirit in which we were seeking to bring this amendment and I'm optimistic that we may, at the next stage, be able to make some progress in that area. Diolch yn fawr.

[296] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A ydych yn dymuno symud i bleidlais ar welliant 69? [297] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Do you wish to move to a vote on amendment 69?

[297] **William Powell:** Yes.

[298] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 69? A oes gwrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 69 i ddangos trwy godi eu dwylo. Pawb yn erbyn. Cyfartal—felly, pleidlais fwrw yn y negyddol. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd 69. [299] **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 69 be agreed to. Are there any objections? [*Objection.*] Therefore we will move to a vote. Everyone who is in favour of amendment 69, please raise your hands. Those against. Tied vote—casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 69 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 69: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 69: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 69.
Amendment 69 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 3 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 3 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[299] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 3 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 3. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 3, felly.

Alun Ffred Jones: I propose amendment 3 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 3 be agreed. Does any Member object? No objection. Therefore, amendment 3 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 3 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 3 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

**Grŵp 7: Cynlluniau Datblygu Lleol (Gwelliannau 70, 152, 153, 154, 71, 124, 155 a 157)
Group 7: Local Development Plans (Amendments 70, 152, 153, 154, 71, 124, 155 and 157)**

[300] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn i grŵp 7—cynlluniau datblygu lleol. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 70 yn enw William Powell. Galwaf ar William Powell i gynnig ei welliant ac i siarad i'w welliant a'r gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp hwn.

Alun Ffred Jones: We move to group 7—local development plans. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 70 in the name of William Powell. I call on William Powell to move his amendment and to speak to his amendment and the other amendments in this group.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 70 (William Powell).
Amendment 70 (William Powell) moved.*

[301] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. As I said earlier in relation to previous amendments around committee recommendation 11, it is my firm belief that due regard has to be paid to the interrelationship that needs to apply between marine planning, on the one hand, and the much better resourced and better understood terrestrial planning, if we are to achieve effective planning decisions. It may be that the Minister maintains that this Bill is principally about terrestrial planning, but, as has been previously pointed out, there are some parts of Wales, for example, Pembrokeshire, which falls in my region and in that of Joyce Watson,

where there is a need for both marine and terrestrial planning policies to be very much joined up if they are to be effective. This applies particularly to offshore energy infrastructure. I think, very shortly, we may be having some exciting announcements around certain of those in other parts of Wales.

11:00

[302] It was also pointed out in the committee report that if the Bill is to amend the Marine and Coastal Access Act 2009 to require marine planning authorities to have regard to the development plans when preparing marine plans, it seems only right and proper that the Bill imposes similar requirements on development plans to have regard to marine planning. That seems to be the quid pro quo. It seems to me that there is an obvious opportunity here, therefore, for the Minister to demonstrate a clear and genuine commitment to ensuring that marine policy gets full and proper consideration when necessary.

[303] I also seek to move and speak to amendment 71. This is on an important area that has not maybe received sufficient airing. It wasn't something that was covered in our committee report; it slipped in maybe a little under the radar in terms of this amendment. This is around dark skies in Wales. I suppose I should declare an interest in this in that I've recently been appointed chair of the international dark sky reserve management board of the Brecon Beacons National Park. In this context, I feel it's really important to include some reference within this Bill to the issue of light pollution. Not only are there significant health benefits associated with the minimisation of light pollution, but it also helps, in a modest but important way, in climate change mitigation and, also, as I flagged up in the context of recent infrastructure investment in the Welsh NHS, in terms of saving public money and redirecting that to the front line. It may be that this provision can be brought forward for discussion in the context of the environment Bill in a more joined-up approach, but I thought it was a useful opportunity to flag up this important issue in the context of this planning Bill, and I'm grateful for your indulgence, Chair.

[304] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you for the interesting information there. Llyr Gruffydd.

[305] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Thank you, Chair. I move amendments 152 to 155 and amendment 157. Now, the top-down approach to planning is nowhere more obvious than in the context of housing need and designing local development plans. The flawed population projections upon which local planning authorities have to base their LDPs have been subject to heavy criticism for a long time now, and this planning Bill, I believe, is an opportunity to address some of those concerns. Amendments 155 and 157 would require local planning authorities to carry out a local housing needs assessment before publishing their LDPs. This would then form the basis for development while giving Welsh Ministers or the Planning Inspectorate an opportunity to challenge them, if they had sufficient evidence. So, this would turn the system back the right way up, as far as I'm concerned—a bottom-up approach to housing development instead of a top-down central Government projection being foisted on planning authorities.

[306] I've also tabled amendments similar to those that I tabled earlier in relation to the NDF. Amendment 152 removes a section that gives a period for which the LDPs have effect. To put a specified expiry date on the LDP will create unnecessary confusion and uncertainty. It should continue to have effect until it is replaced, as I articulated earlier. Amendment 153 places a duty to have regard to socioeconomic disadvantage in decision making at LDP level, mirroring similar amendments of mine earlier. Amendment 154 will require local development plans to set out policies designed to contribute to climate change reduction targets and adaptation, again reflecting a previous amendment in another context.

[307] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much.

Russell George i siarad.

Russell George to speak.

[308] **Russell George:** Thanks, Chair. I move amendment 124 in the name of Suzy Davies. This continues the trail of thought that concerns inconsistency, and this amendment is the next logical step in arguing in favour of due regard being given to sustainability appraisals. Amendment 124 simply requires Ministers to include the appraisal as one of the considerations in the list that attracts the due regard duty under section 62(5)(f). So, again, Suzy Davies argues that there is no point asking for an appraisal if no-one is obliged unequivocally to give it due regard in the relevant decision-making process.

[309] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. A oes unrhyw Aelod arall yn dymuno siarad? Does any other Member wish to speak? Joyce.

[310] **Joyce Watson:** Yes. Thank you, Chair. I want to speak to amendment 70, which actually calls on local planning authorities to take note of, and work having regard to, marine plans. Again, you know, it's not that I'm particularly against that, because I'm clearly not. I would welcome an opportunity to look to bring that forward. Whilst it might not be today, and it might not be in its current form, I would support moving for word in that regard.

[311] The other amendment I want to speak to is amendment 152, which has been moved in the name of Llyr Gruffydd. I can't support this amendment. My concern with this amendment is that, if we don't have an end date, the existing plans could just carry on in perpetuity, and I don't necessarily think that that would be an advantageous situation. So, that's my contribution.

[312] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Y Gweinidog i siarad. The Minister to speak.

[313] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. As discussed in relation to amendments 66 and 68, tabled in William Powell's name earlier, I support the principle behind amendment 72. It's just the technical drafting of this amendment. I would ask the Member not to move that amendment. I will work with him on discussions to move towards Stage 3/4 to see whether we can come to some agreement on what could be tabled at that appropriate point. That's with regard to the marine plans produced by Welsh Ministers and the relationship with LDPs. I'm happy to do so, subject to the Member's agreement.

[314] With regard to the amendments in the name of Llyr Gruffydd, 155 and 157, regarding housing need, you'll have to forgive me: I'm slightly confused on this basis, as local authorities already prepare local housing market assessments. The population projections are the starting point, and they can move away where they do have evidence. I do recognise also that the Member has concerns around this, and I'd be happy to have a discussion with him to see whether there's anything more on clarity that we may need to use in respect of the next stage.

[315] On 153 and 154, we believe we've addressed this issue by the passage of the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill yesterday regarding sustainable development. With regard to Bill's amendment 71, on light pollution, it's an interesting subject that the Member raises, and I would be content to have some discussions with him. We wouldn't be seeking to support that amendment today, but it's something that I think the Member is right to raise in committee, and I will be happy to have a conversation with him and my team.

[316] With regard to amendments 124 and 152, on the LDP, I do believe that this would be inappropriate. This would create uncertainty in terms of the timeline presented around an LDP there. Local authorities are at high risk when there is no LDP in place, or one that is not

effective. I would urge Members not to support that without the evidence provided behind that in order to move forward today.

[317] I will not be seeking to support any amendments in this group, as drafted, but as I've indicated I will be happy to work with Members to see how we can clarify some of them for a later stage.

[318] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. William Powell i ymateb i'r ddadl. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. William Powell to respond to the debate.

[319] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I am grateful, Minister, for that response and the combination of your undertaking and the comments of Joyce Watson in her informal role as committee business manager for this process. I think it's really encouraging that we've got the opportunity maybe to move some progress in that area. So, I'm happy to abstain from moving that amendment today—that being amendment 70, tabled in my name.

[320] I welcome the comments of colleagues with regard to the housing projections issue and issues around that that Llyr Gruffydd has raised today and also previously. I am supportive of amendment 24, brought forward in the name of Suzy Davies, and feel that it would be of benefit in terms of buttressing the credibility of the sustainability appraisal that is envisaged within the Bill. I'm very grateful also to the Minister for his comments regarding the issue of light pollution, and I would like to proceed. I'm looking to move that amendment today to test the level of support, but I also look forward to engaging with the Minister directly on that matter. Thank you very much.

[321] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, gwelliant 70. William, a ydych chi'n symud neu a ydych chi'n tynnu hwnnw'n ôl? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Therefore, amendment 70. William, are you moving or withdrawing?

[322] **William Powell:** Not move.

[323] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Pawb yn hapus? Felly, mae gwelliant 70 wedi ei dynnu'n ôl. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Is everybody content? Therefore, amendment 70 has been withdrawn.

*Tynnwyd gwelliant 70 yn ôl gyda chaniatâd y pwyllgor.
Amendment 70 withdrawn by leave of the committee.*

[324] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 152? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 152?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 152 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 152 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[325] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[326] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 152? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, felly mae'r gwelliant yn cael ei wrthod. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 152 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll proceed to a vote. Those in favour, please indicate. Those against. There is a tied vote, so I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 152: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 152: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	
Gruffydd, Llyr	Hedges, Mike	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Morgan, Julie	
Powell, William	Rathbone, Jenny	
Sandbach, Antoinette	Watson, Joyce	

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 152.
Amendment 152 not agreed.*

[327] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno symud gwelliant 153? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 153?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 153 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 153 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[328] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[329] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 153? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid i godi i dwylo i 153. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd y gwelliant. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 153 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll proceed to a vote. All in favour please raise your hands to 153. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, so the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 153: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 153: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	
Gruffydd, Llyr	Hedges, Mike	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Morgan, Julie	
Powell, William	Rathbone, Jenny	
Sandbach, Antoinette	Watson, Joyce	

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 153.
Amendment 153 not agreed.*

[330] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n cynnig gwelliant 154? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 154?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 154 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 154 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[331] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[332] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 154? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb o blaid 154 i ddangos. Diolch yn fawr. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, felly mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd y gwelliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 154 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] Proceed to a vote. All those in favour of 154 to indicate. Thank you. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, therefore the amendment is not agreed.

Gwelliant 154: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 154: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 154.
Amendment 154 not agreed.

[333] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 71?

Alun Ffred Jones: William, do you wish to move amendment 71?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 71 (William Powell).
Amendment 71 (William Powell) moved.

[334] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

William Powell: Move.

[335] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 71. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid ddangos drwy godi eu dwylo. Ac yn erbyn. Felly, mae'n gyfartal ac mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 71.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 71 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll proceed to a vote. All in favour, please raise your hands. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, therefore amendment 71 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 71: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 71: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell

Antoniw, Mick

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 71.
Amendment 71 not agreed.*

[336] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 124 yn enw Suzy Davies?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 124 in the name of Suzy Davies?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 124 (Suzy Davies).
Amendment 124 (Suzy Davies) moved.*

[337] **Russell George:** Yes, move.

[338] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 124? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 124 i ddangos os gwelwch fod yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal ac mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 124.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 124 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll proceed to a vote. Those in favour of amendment 124, please indicate. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, therefore amendment 124 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 124: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 124: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 124.
Amendment 124 not agreed.*

[339] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 155?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 155?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 155 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 155 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[340] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[341] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 155? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Dyna ni. Symud i bleidlais. Pawb o blaid gwelliant 155 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, felly mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd y gwelliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 155 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] There we are. Therefore, we'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 155, please indicate. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, therefore the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 155: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 155: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 155.
Amendment 155 not agreed.*

[342] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 156?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 156?

[343] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Nid wyf. Mi wnes i esbonio'n gynharach na fuaswn i'n cynnig y gwelliant yma.

Llyr Gruffydd: I don't. I explained earlier that I would not be moving this amendment.

[344] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Pawb yn hapus bod hwnnw'n cael ei dynnu'n ôl? Iawn.

Alun Ffred Jones: Everybody content that it's withdrawn? Fine.

*Tynnwyd gwelliant 156 yn ôl gyda chaniatâd y pwyllgor.
Amendment 156 withdrawn by leave of the committee.*

[345] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 157?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 157?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 157 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 157 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[346] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[347] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 157? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais felly. Pawb o blaid 157 i ddangos.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 157 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of 157, please indicate.

Pawb sydd yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal, mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 157. All against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, therefore amendment 157 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 157: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 157: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 157.
Amendment 157 not agreed.*

[348] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 72? **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 72?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 72 (William Powell).
Amendment 72 (William Powell) moved.*

[349] **William Powell:** Move.

[350] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 72? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 72, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 72. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 72 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 72, please indicate. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, therefore amendment 72 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 72: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 72: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 72.

Amendment 72 not agreed.

[351] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 98?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 98?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 98 (Russell George).

Amendment 98 (Russell George) moved.

[352] **Russell George:** Yes, move.

[353] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 98. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 98 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'r gwelliant hwnnw wedi colli.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 98 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 98, please indicate. And against. That amendment is not accepted.

Gwelliant 98: O blaid 2, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 8.

Amendment 98: For 2, Abstain 0, Against 8.

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Gruffydd, Llyr
Hedges, Mike
Jones, Alun Ffred
Morgan, Julie
Powell, William
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 98.

Amendment 98 not agreed.

Grŵp 8: Aseidiadau o'r Effaith ar Iechyd (Gwelliant 99)

Group 8: Health Impact Assessments (Amendment 99)

[354] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 99 yn enw Russell George. Galwaf ar Russell i symud gwelliant 99 a siarad am ei welliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: The lead amendment in the group is amendment 99 in the name of Russell George. I call on Russell to move amendment 99 and speak to his amendment.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 98 (Russell George).

Amendment 98 (Russell George) moved.

[355] **Russell George:** I'm pleased to move amendment 99, the only amendment in this group, which would formally introduce health impact assessments into the planning process. During the consultation process for Stage 1, quite a number of consultees, including the British Medical Association, called for a statutory requirement for health impact assessments to be carried out at various stages of the planning system. Now, as a Conservative, I'm naturally disposed towards ensuring that the burden of unnecessary bureaucracy on business or public bodies is reduced or eliminated, but there is a fine line, I think, to be walked here between what may at first be deemed unnecessary regulation and something that may be critical in maintaining the health and wellbeing of not just individuals citizens but entire communities.

11:15

[356] I have to say, the arguments for health impact assessments for certain developments—like the ones that fall within DNS, developments of national significance, and major categories—were persuasive and had a lot of traction with me personally, especially given what’s happening in Montgomeryshire at the moment. It’s right, of course, that decisions of this nature are not rushed, I should add. I also note that the Minister’s got a windfarm application to determine on 7 April in my constituency. So, given his comments in the last grouping, I think I’ll see that that’ll be on time.

[357] I should say that I’m not taking an anti-windfarm stance here, in my wider points. That’s not what I’m doing. As I see it, Members who have long campaigned for improved regulation on opencast mining, for example, may want to advocate this amendment, too. So, I appreciate what the Minister has said in his letter of 26 February on this issue, regarding the strategic environmental assessment process and highlighting the new European environmental impact assessment that will come on-stream in the UK in 2017. That will improve and enhance emphasis on human health during assessment. However, these largely are impact assessments of the environment and only scratch the surface, I think, of the potential intended consequences that a development or project may have on human health. So, the health impact assessments will examine these issues in far greater depth. Also, as with the current EIA requirements, the new EIA will only apply on certain planning applications. Therefore, not all DNS applications would require an EIA.

[358] So, I think this amendment has merit, as it will strengthen the links between public health and planning. If it makes Government and local planning authorities think differently about the way a development will impact on public health, that can only be a good thing.

[359] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Are there A oes Aelodau eraill am siarad? Jenny? other Members who wish to speak? Jenny?

[360] **Jenny Rathbone:** I just want to say that it’s good to hear Russell George at least linking this amendment to the windfarm discussions that go on and on and on and never get resolved. What you’re trying to do is tie health impact assessments into things for which there is no definitive answer. There will already be health impact assessments in generalities in terms of local development plans and regional development plans, so I think this amendment should be resisted.

[361] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Weinidog? Minister?

[362] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, and I thank Russell George for elaborating on the amendment that he’s tabled. I know the Member is well informed, but he may be slightly mistaken regarding the opencast process. There is already a requirement for a health impact assessment policy in opencast. So, just to clarify that for the Member, for future reference.

[363] I do understand what the Member is seeking to do here. The issue is about balance, and I think what we have to ensure is that, while the health impact assessment is generally well understood, in how that is attributed, we believe it’s best achieved at a plan-making level through mandatory strategic environmental assessments. The European strategic environmental assessment directive and regulations require impacts on human health to be comprehensively considered during the preparation of a development plan. As Jenny quite rightly alluded to, we believe this could be onerous, and the Member did refer to that in his opening contribution, on where and how this is applied. I think it has to be very delicately handled. Large developments may be subject to EIAs, which require the analysis of the likely significant effect on the environment, including that, where relevant, to human health. So, we

believe this is already appropriately covered in legislation, and we will be seeking to resist this amendment albeit tabled, I believe, in good spirit by Russell George today.

[364] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Russell i ymateb. Russell to respond.

[365] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. I should just say to Jenny Rathbone that my contribution wasn't to do with windfarms; it was to do with health impact assessments, and that was my view on that. I'm pleased to be wrong on the opencast mining. I'm pleased that I'm wrong on that, and pleased that the Minister has provided clarification to me on that. I'm pleased that he's noted that my amendment is put in good spirit. But, of course, although they might be taken into account with opencast mining, there are other applications for which I think that health impact assessments should also be taken into account.

[366] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Russell, do Russell, a ydych chi eisiau symud i bleidlais ar welliant 99? you wish to proceed to a vote on amendment 99?

[367] **Russell George:** Yes. Move.

[368] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 99. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 99 i godi eu dwylo. Ac, yn erbyn. Mae'r gwelliant wedi'i gollu. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 99 be agreed to. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 99, please raise your hands. And, against. The amendment has fallen.

*Gwelliant 99: O blaid 4, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 99: For 4, Abstain 1, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Jones, Alun Ffred

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 99.
Amendment 99 not agreed.*

Grŵp 9: Gweithdrefn Cyn Ymgeisio (Gwelliannau 73, 101, 83 ac 84) Group 9: Pre-application Procedure (Amendments 73, 101, 83 and 84)

[369] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Grŵp 9 yw gweithdrefn cyn ymgeisio. Mae gwelliannau 73 i 84 yn y grŵp yma. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 73 yn enw William Powell a galwaf ar William Powell i gynnig gwelliant 73 ac i siarad i'r gwelliant a'r gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Group 9 relates to pre-application procedures. Amendments 73 to 84 are in this group. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 73 in the name of William Powell. I call on William Powell to move amendment 73 and to speak to that amendment and others in this group.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 73 (William Powell).
Amendment 73 (William Powell) moved.*

[370] **William Powell:** Diolch yn fawr, Gadeirydd. I speak to and move amendments 73, 83, and indeed 84 in this group. As I've previously stated, it's important to me and to my group that the water and sewage undertakers that play such a key role in ensuring the deliverability of planning applications within the wider Welsh planning process are made statutory consultees within that process. I am given to understand that the consultation process around this matter may, in fact, be more one that would fall to secondary legislation, and that an amendment, maybe, is not strictly required at this particular stage. However, I've tabled the amendment for the purposes of seeking reassurance from the Minister on this point, and I hope that it is seen as a positive initiative in that particular regard.

[371] In terms of amendment 83 and indeed amendment 84, also in this group, they seek to amend the procedure from negative to affirmative for a development Order, which sets out the categories of development that will be subject to the new requirement for pre-application consultation. This is, indeed, in accordance with committee recommendation 23. This means in practice that the Order would need to be laid before the Assembly and voted on before coming into force, thereby allowing and requiring greater scrutiny by the Assembly. I think, in that context, it would provide a valuable safeguard for the effectiveness of the planning process, and also to ensure proportionality in that matter. So, I look forward to hearing Members' contribution on this section.

[372] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you, William Powell. Russell George. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you, William Powell. Russell George.

[373] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. The rationale for moving amendment 101 is that there are concerns within the agricultural and landowning community in Wales that the cumulative effect of secondary legislation proposals that will follow from this Bill will have a detrimental impact on those sectors, particularly financially. The shifting in cost burden from the local planning authority to the applicant for any development deemed 'major'—a revised application fee together with the introduction of a conditional discharge fee—comes to far more than a 15 per cent increase in real terms. In essence, this could well be regarded as an unjustified increase where the local planning authority would potentially yield a significantly larger fee for the planning consents, while actually undertaking considerably less work.

[374] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you, Russell. Are Russell. A oes Aelodau eraill? Llyr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you, Russell. Are there any other Members? Llyr.

[375] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Jest yn fyr i esbonio **Llyr Gruffydd:** Just very briefly to explain I won't be supporting amendment 101, because na fyddaf yn cefnogi gwelliant 101, oherwydd rwy'n meddwl bod gwahardd I think that preventing local planning awdurdodau cynllunio lleol rhag codi unrhyw authorities from charging any kind of fee is fath o dâl yn ormodol. Nid yw hynny i disproportionate. That's not to say that I ddweud, wrth gwrs, ein bod ni'n dymuno bod would wish to see a charge being levied, of yna dâl yn cael ei godi, ond rwy'n meddwl ei course, but I do think it's important that we at bod hi'n bwysig ein bod ni o leiaf yn least allow for that possibility. caniatáu'r posibilrwydd hynny iddyn nhw.

[376] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Anyone else? Neb arall? Joyce Watson. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Anyone else? Joyce Watson.

[377] **Joyce Watson:** Chair, just very briefly, I would like to speak to amendment 73. In principle, of course, I would support this, because there have been many applications in our very large area that would, perhaps, have benefitted from this in the first place, but I can't support it in its current form.

[378] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Minister. Weinidog.

[379] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. Again, as Joyce Watson points out on William Powell's amendment 73, the principle of this amendment is something that we would seek to support. I would ask him not to move it in this case, as it would mean its deletion at Stage 3 and then a reintroduction of a further amendment, but I will work with him to see how we can put this on a statutory footing.

[380] With regard to amendments 83 and 84, requiring subordinate legislation prescribing the types of development subject to pre-application consultation, under the affirmative procedure, I don't support that principle. Again, I understand what the Member is trying to do, but we will have to agree to disagree on that point.

[381] With regard to amendment 101 regarding costings, I do understand this is the position of the Country Land and Business Association regarding issues regarding pre-application consultation and advice. We've worked very hard to understand sectors with regard to communities being engaged at an early point in any development, and the pre-consultation process is one that has been well received. I also believe that the local planning authorities that deal with these applications, at whatever point they are dealing with them, should be funded appropriately to have the mechanisms to recover costs. Therefore, I don't think this is a particularly onerous point of financing and delivery, but what it does ensure is good communication with communities and with developers, so I think this is just good practice. There is a consultation document that has been issued regarding fees and charges for local planning authorities, and, of course, that will be reflected in charges and costs to be attributed to these services in the future.

[382] As I indicated earlier, I would be happy to support William Powell on amendment 73 at Stage 3 if we can redraft that proposal and he seeks not to move it in this session today.

[383] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. William Powell i ymateb. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. William Powell to reply.

[384] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I'm very grateful to the Minister for his indication of broad support for the sentiments that I'm seeking to bring forward in amendment 73, and also for the contribution of Joyce Watson. In the light of those comments, I shall not be moving this amendment today and would be grateful if no other Members would intervene and move it on my behalf.

[385] In terms of amendment 101, I think it is important that authorities have some level of discretion in this matter, both in terms of being able to recover some of the costs for pre-application advice, and also in the important area of wider development briefs that sometimes are appropriate, particularly for large and medium-sized brownfield developments, where it's important and constructive to have a developer contribution, but at arm's length. So, I shall be resisting supporting that amendment—101.

[386] I'm disappointed that the Minister doesn't take a like view to mine in terms of amendments 83 and 84. I do call on Members, if they feel able, to support those, because I feel it's an important principle. Thank you very much.

[387] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Therefore, Felly, mae William Powell yn dymuno tynnu William Powell wishes to withdraw gwelliant 73 yn ôl. Pawb yn hapus? Felly, nid amendment 73. Is everybody content? yw gwelliant 73 yn cael ei symud. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Therefore, amendment 73 is not moved.

*Tynnwyd gwelliant 73 yn ôl gyda chaniatâd y pwyllgor.
Amendment 73 withdrawn by leave of the committee.*

[388] **Alun Ffred Jones:** We are proceeding at a stately pace, and I would welcome brevity, while not wishing to stop anybody from speaking and making their points.

Grŵp 10: Datblygiadau o Arwyddocâd Cenedlaethol (Gwelliannau 100, 158, 159, 102, 103, 160, 161, 104, 162, 163, 164, 165, 166, 167, 168, 169, 170, 171, 172, 53, 112, 86, 120 a 55)

Group 10: Developments of National Significance (Amendments 100, 158, 159, 102, 103, 160, 161, 104, 162, 163, 164, 165, 166, 167, 168, 169, 170, 171, 172, 53, 112, 86, 120 and 55)

[389] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symud ymlaen— grŵp 10, datblygiadau o arwyddocâd cenedlaethol yw'r grŵp yma, gyda nifer o welliannau. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 100 yn enw Russell George. Galwaf ar Russell i symud gwelliant 100 a siarad am ei welliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: Moving on to group 10, developments of national significance. There are a number of amendments. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 100 in the name of Russell George. I call on Russell to move amendment 100 and speak to his amendment.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 100 (Russell George).
Amendment 100 (Russell George) moved.*

[390] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. I am pleased to move amendments 100, 102, 103, 104, 112, 86 and 120 in this grouping. While many respondents welcomed the new category of 'development of national significance', there were some notable exceptions. The Minister will be aware of the views of the Welsh Local Government Association and the Planning Officers Society regarding DNS. They felt it was confusing and unnecessary to introduce this designation, given the amount of applications that fall within this category that are dealt with each year.

11:30

[391] Their view was that the local planning authority should be better trained and resourced so that they have the capacity and skill base to deal with it themselves, and I have some sympathy with that view. However, one thing that was clear was that, if the designation was to remain, there should be clear categorisation of the Bill so that everyone within the development tiers was clear about what will be dealt with by Welsh Ministers and whether a pre-application process would apply.

[392] Amendment 100 seeks to add section 62D, which is DNS applications made by Welsh Ministers, to section 15, which is the requirement to carry out pre-application consultation. I think we would all expect that, on developments that fall within the DNS category where Ministers will make a final application decision, a pre-consultation process would naturally apply.

[393] Amendments 102, 104, 120 and 86 will have definite linkages around the issues of the criteria for developments of national significance. Both the Environment and Sustainability Committee and the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee highlighted this issue at Stage 1, and, for me, this is pretty straightforward in that, more or less, we have no idea what's going to be defined as a development of national significance, as was set out in the 'Positive Planning' consultation that preceded the Bill. Therefore, given that section 17 of the Bill will give Welsh Ministers the power to make decisions on DNS applications rather than local planning authorities, I see no reason why it shouldn't be on the

face of the Bill. Now, as the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee rightly pointed out in its overall assessment of the Bill, it's disappointing that more detail has not been put on the face of the Bill, particularly in relation to significant policy matters. That is a significant policy matter. I have, I hope, allowed the Minister flexibility with amendment 104 so that, through regulation and criteria, it can be amended. I hope that provides him with some reassurance that he can support these amendments. Amendment 120 has to be read in conjunction with amendment 104.

[394] The rationale behind amendment 103 is to probe further the Minister's response to recommendation 26 from the Stage 1 report regarding what process the Government intends to use when deciding on energy projects of 50 MW or above, now that the St David's agreement has been published. While this may not sit in his portfolio, as he has previously stated—I understand that—the planning system is a delivery mechanism with applications across several portfolios. Co-ordinated actions at all government levels are, of course, vital, and you are, of course, leading and co-ordinating this Bill on behalf of the Government. Given that the Government's submission on Silk part 2 asked for these further powers, you must have had, I assume, some detailed discussions within Government on how they could be implemented within the new system and what process should be used. The Minister's shaking his head, but he can expand on that in his response, I hope. So, will the nationally significant infrastructure project development consent Order process be replicated for Wales or will they be included in the DNS process, and will the process include associated connected developments as well? I think it is pertinent that we get some more detailed information from the Minister on this issue. If, for example, associated developments for large-scale energy projects are to be incorporated within the overall application, there's another power being removed from local planning authorities and concentrated in the hands of the relevant Welsh Minister. So, if the Minister is unsure, I'm happy to give him the options within this amendment to include them in the DNS process.

[395] Amendment 122 is in relation to provisions of compensation payments to be made in respect of an application for planning permission made to Welsh Ministers under the DNS category, which also includes associated development. As you can imagine, it's been the hot topic of conversation in my constituency for a number of years. While the Minister may say that there are sufficient appropriate mechanisms in place to compensate individuals and communities that are disproportionately affected by developments through other mechanisms, planning obligations on landowners, or compulsory purchase acquisitions, I think there's an issue with devaluation of land and property blight, and particularly with energy developments that must be addressed. I think that's a particular issue that I hope will be addressed. I'll leave it there, Chair.

[396] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Llyr Gruffydd i siarad. Llyr Gruffydd to speak.

[397] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Thank you, Chair. I move amendments 158 through to 168, and amendments 171 and 172. I'll be supporting the majority of the amendments in this group, with the exception of amendments 102, 104 and 86.

[398] Now, my amendments to this group are aimed again at limiting the removal of power away from local communities. Amendment 158, with the consequential amendment 159, makes it an option, rather than mandatory, for applications for developments of national significance to be made to a Welsh Minister. It's accompanied by amendments that would ensure that Ministers are notified in such a situation where a developer chooses to apply to a local planning authority, namely amendments 163, 164 and 165. Now, Ministers already have call-in powers, of course, at their disposal. Most developments will have impacts on local services, for example, in terms of housing or transport, maybe in relation to large employment sites or out-of-town retail parks. Now, these issues aren't always properly understood at

national level by an inspector or Minister who don't have the same detailed local knowledge as representatives closer to those communities.

[399] Amendment 166 inserts a new clause to ensure that Welsh Ministers can't make decisions instead of Natural Resources Wales unless, of course, Natural Resources Wales gives consent for that to be the case.

[400] Amendment 160, with the consequential amendment 161, ensures that applications for housing, retail or leisure cannot be considered a development of national significance. I fully accept that there are certain kinds of developments that should be considered nationally significant, and in such instances, of course, I accept that the Welsh Minister is sometimes best placed to make those decisions. A large-scale energy plant, for example, clearly has national significance, as does maybe a new motorway, but I don't accept that, under any circumstances, provision of housing, retail or leisure facilities can be considered nationally significant, even in somewhere like Bodelwyddan in Denbighshire, where we're talking of astronomical numbers of housing. I can't see that that would be of national significance.

[401] Amendment 162 will require all applications of national significance to be accompanied by an environmental impact assessment. A facilitative planning system doesn't have to come at the expense of protecting the environment. They can, and they should, both be prioritised in my view.

[402] Amendment 167 makes it mandatory for provision about consultation to be included before secondary consent is granted or refused. Again, this is to offset the centralisation of power and gives local communities some say, at least, on nationally significant developments.

[403] Amendment 168 seeks to give local planning authorities enough notice to comply with section 19, which is to submit a local impact report in respect of an application for a development of national significance. Sufficient notice will be required in order to ensure the local impact report is of a sufficient standard and is fit for purpose.

[404] Amendment 171 gives community councils a voice by offering community councils the chance to submit—[*Inaudible.*]—reports. While decisions are being taken further and further away, this amendment seeks to offset the dwindling power of communities by giving the most local level of government stronger influence on decisions.

[405] Amendment 172 states what local impact reports should consider and lists public services, infrastructure, natural resources, the Welsh language and health of inhabitants in the area. This is to ensure a standard is set for local impact reports that must be followed by local planning authorities. I'll be voting against amendment 86 and consequential amendments 102 and 104. Although I'll be supportive of putting a list of what developments of national significance are on the face of the Bill, the amendments proposed leave out energy, deliberately of course, which I cannot support.

[406] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much.
William Powell. William Powell.

[407] **William Powell:** Dim, diolch, **William Powell:** No, thank you, Chair.
Gadeirydd.

[408] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Ocê. A oes **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay. Are there other
unrhyw un arall eisiau siarad? Na. Y Member who wish to speak? No. I call on the
Gweinidog, felly. Minister, therefore.

[409] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I seek to support Government amendments 53 and

55 in this category. They address committee recommendation 30, establishing a statutory timescale of 36 weeks for DNS, in the committee report as submitted. There are many amendments tabled by colleagues in this group today. I don't quite understand the whole narrative around the discussion of the planning issue that Russell George raises. One moment he's telling me it's a really important procedure to have local determination and attribute that to local democracy, and then, in the same guise, he, and many other Members, have written to me asking for call-in procedures to be applied to many developments—not always of national significance. So, I'm slightly lost in the interpretation of how and when this is appropriate or when it isn't. What we are seeking to do within this Bill is to be very clear on what DNS will or will not be through a consultation process. It's premature, therefore, to put on the face of the Bill what DNS procedures would apply to. Therefore, we are keen to ensure that, as we bring this forward, we engage with communities on that process.

[410] Llyr raises many issues again and, again, there are elements in there on which I think we can seek to have further discussions at the next stage, in terms of some clarification around some of the detail he's seeking to achieve. But—not through Members' fault or committee's fault, Chair—the amount of amendments that were tabled at quite a late stage in the procedure has caused some issues around drafting competency within the structure of the Bill. That's not to say that they're not relevant or they are not lawful. It is just how they fit into the Bill and how they would be interpreted, and that is what we will be seeking to clarify with Members as we move forward in respect of that.

[411] I'm grateful for the opportunity to clarify some of the issues. The issue of DNS is also—. I do not accept the argument that communities will not be able to be engaged in that process. That is not the case and it isn't the case now with any development that's called in in that process. That's a misinterpretation of fact. I'm happy to work with Members to bring forward amendments at Stage 3 on some of the issues the Members raise, but not on all of them, today.

[412] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Russell i ymateb. Russell to reply.

[413] **Russell George:** I'm not sure whether the Minister has seen the report published jointly last spring by the London School of Economics, which looked at valuing the visual impact of wind turbines through house prices. I hope he has, because the Government were a commissioning sponsor of that report, although that wasn't widely publicised. Now, all the data suggested that windfarm visibility reduces local house prices and the implied visual environmental costs are substantial. So, people have been hung out to dry, I think, through no fault of their own, and the situation is only going to increase in Wales, because of Government policy and, therefore, I think it's right that something legitimately should be done to address it.

[414] **Carl Sargeant:** Government policy—could you clarify that?

[415] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Sorry, Minister, you're not allowed to intervene.

[416] **Carl Sargeant:** That's fine. You say what you want, then.

[417] **Russell George:** I'll write to you.

[418] **Carl Sargeant:** Okay.

[419] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Have you finished?

[420] **Russell George:** Yes.

[421] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn ymlaen, felly. Russell, a hoffech chi symud i bleidlais ar welliant 100?

Alun Ffred Jones: We'll move on, then. Russell, do you wish to proceed to a vote on amendment 100?

[422] **Russell George:** I move.

[423] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 100? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 100 i ddangos hynny drwy godi dwylo. Diolch yn fawr. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Mae fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, felly ni dderbynnir gwelliant 100.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 100 be agreed to. Is there any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote, therefore. Those in favour of amendment 100 to raise their hands. Thank you very much. And against. It's a tied vote. My casting vote is in the negative, therefore amendment 100 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 100: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 100: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 100.
Amendment 100 not agreed.*

[424] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 101?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 101?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 101 (Russell George).
Amendment 101 (Russell George) moved.*

[425] **Russell George:** Yes. Move.

[426] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 101? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 101 i ddangos hynny. Ac yn erbyn. Ymatal. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 101.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 101 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. Those in favour of amendment 101, please raise your hands. And against. Abstaining. Therefore, amendment 101 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 101: O blaid 2, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 8.
Amendment 101: For 2, Abstain 0, Against 8.*

O blaid:

Yn erbyn:

Ymatal:

For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Gruffydd, Llyr Hedges, Mike Jones, Alun Ffred Morgan, Julie Powell, William Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 101.
Amendment 101 not agreed.*

[427] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 158? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 158?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 158 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 158 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[428] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

11:45

[429] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 158? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 158 i ddangos trwy godi dwylo. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Felly, pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 158. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 158 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 158 to indicate by raising their hands. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 158 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 158: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 158: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 158.
Amendment 158 not agreed.*

[430] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 159? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 159?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 159 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 159 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[431] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[432] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 159? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 159 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 159.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 159 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 159, please indicate. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, therefore, amendment 159 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 159: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 159: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 159.
Amendment 159 not agreed.*

[433] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, gwelliant 102?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 102?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 102 (Russell George).
Amendment 102 (Russell George) moved.*

[434] **Russell George:** Move.

[435] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A ddylid derbyn gwelliant 102? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 102 i ddangos os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 102.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 102 be agreed? Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of amendment 102, please indicate. And against. Amendment 102 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 102: O blaid 2, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 8.
Amendment 102: For 2, Abstain 0, Against 8.*

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Gruffydd, Llyr
Hedges, Mike
Jones, Alun Ffred

Morgan, Julie
Powell, William
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 102.
Amendment 102 not agreed.*

[436] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 103?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 103?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 103 (Russell George).
Amendment 103 (Russell George) moved.*

[437] **Russell George:** Move.

[438] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A ddylid derbyn gwelliant 103? A oes gwrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 103 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd 103.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 103 be agreed? Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of amendment 103, please indicate. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, 103 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 103: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 103: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 103.
Amendment 103 not agreed.*

[439] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 160?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 160?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 160 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 160 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[440] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[441] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cynnig yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 160. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid 160 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Bwrw pleidlais fwrw

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 160 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of 160, please indicate. And against. As there is a tied vote,

negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd 160.

I use my casting vote in the negative.
Therefore, amendment 160 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 160: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 160: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	
Gruffydd, Llyr	Hedges, Mike	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Morgan, Julie	
Powell, William	Rathbone, Jenny	
Sandbach, Antoinette	Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 160.
Amendment 160 not agreed.*

[442] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 161, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 161?
Llyr?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 161 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 161 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[443] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[444] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 161? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i amendment 161 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid 161 i ddangos, a vote. All those in favour of 161, please os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. indicate. And against. As there's a tied vote, I Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd use my casting vote in the negative. 161. Therefore, 161 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 161: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 161: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	
Gruffydd, Llyr	Hedges, Mike	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Morgan, Julie	
Powell, William	Rathbone, Jenny	
Sandbach, Antoinette	Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 161.
Amendment 161 not agreed.*

[445] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, gwelliant 104?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 104?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 104 (Russell George).
Amendment 104 (Russell George) moved.*

[446] **Russell George:** Move.

[447] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 104? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 104 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais honno wedi ei cholli. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 104.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 104 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 104, please indicate. And against. That vote is lost. Therefore, amendment 104 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 104: O blaid 2, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 7.

Amendment 104: For 2, Abstain 1, Against 7.

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Gruffydd, Llyr
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Powell, William
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Jones, Alun Ffred

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 104.
Amendment 104 not agreed.*

[448] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 162?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 162?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 162 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 162 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[449] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[450] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 162? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid 162 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn, ac felly, ni dderbyniwyd 162.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 162 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of 162, please indicate. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote against the amendment, therefore 162 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 162: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 162: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell

Antoniw, Mick

Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 162.
Amendment 162 not agreed.*

[451] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 163?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 163?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 163 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 163 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[452] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[453] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 163? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid 163 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Ni dderbyniwyd 163.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 163 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All those in favour of 163, please indicate. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, 163 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 163: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 163: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 163.
Amendment 163 not agreed.*

[454] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 164?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 164?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 164 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 164 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[455] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[456] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 164? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid 164 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Diolch yn fawr. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 164.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 164 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of 164 to indicate. Thank you. And against. As there's a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 164 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 164: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 164: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 164.
Amendment 164 not agreed.*

[457] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 165?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 165?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 165 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 165 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[458] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[459] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 165? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 165 i ddangos. Pawb sy'n erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 165.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 165 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All in favour of amendment 165 to indicate. All those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 165 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 165: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 165: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 165.
Amendment 165 not agreed.*

[460] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 166? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 166?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 166 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 166 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[461] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[462] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 166? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid 166 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 166. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 166 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We proceed to a vote. All those in favour of 166, please indicate. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 166 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 166: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 166: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	
Gruffydd, Llyr	Hedges, Mike	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Morgan, Julie	
Powell, William	Rathbone, Jenny	
Sandbach, Antoinette	Watson, Joyce	

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 166.
Amendment 166 not agreed.*

[463] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 167, Llyr? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 167, Llyr?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 167 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 167 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[464] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[465] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 167? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 167 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal—felly pleidlais fwrw yn negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 167 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 167, please indicate. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the

gwelliant 167.

negative, therefore amendment 167 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 167: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 167: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid:

Yn erbyn:

Ymatal:

For:

Against:

Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 167.

Amendment 167 not agreed.

**Grŵp 11: Drafftio a Thechnegol (Gwelliannau 52, 109, 110, 40, 41, 117, 42 a 43)
Group 11: Drafting and Technical (Amendments 52, 109, 110, 40, 41, 117, 42 and 43)**

[466] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym yn symud i grŵp 11, yn araf. Mae hwn ynglŷn â drafftio a thechnegol. Gwelliannau drafftio a thechnegol ydy'r rhain. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 52 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad.

Alun Ffred Jones: We move to group 11, slowly. This relates to drafting and technical amendments. These are drafting and technical amendments. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 52 in the name of the Minister. I call on the Minister to speak to his amendment.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 52 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 52 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[467] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. We'll be seeking your support for the Government amendments in this group. They are drafting and technical amendments. I formally move.

[468] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Russell George.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you. Russell George.

[469] **Russell George:** I move amendments 109, 110 and 117, which are just technical amendments.

[470] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes rhywun eisiau siarad? Na. Weinidog?

Alun Ffred Jones: Does anybody wish to speak? No. Minister?

[471] **Carl Sargeant:** No.

[472] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 52 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 52? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Felly, mae gwelliant 52 wedi ei dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 52 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 52 be agreed. Does any Member object? Therefore, amendment 52 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 52 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 52 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[473] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych yn dymuno cynnig gwelliant 168? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 168?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 168 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 168 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[474] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[475] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 168? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 168 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal—felly pleidlais fwrw yn negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 168. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 168 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 168, please indicate. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 168 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 168: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 168: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 168.
Amendment 168 not agreed.*

[476] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 169, Llyr? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 169, Llyr?

[477] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Na, nid wyf yn dymuno ei symud, Gadeirydd. Dylwn i fod wedi esbonio hynny fel rhan o fy nghyfraniad i. **Llyr Gruffydd:** No, I don't wish to move. I should have explained that as part of my contribution.

[478] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Pawb yn hapus i Llyr dynnu'r gwelliant yn ôl? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Is everybody content for Llyr to withdraw the amendment?

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 169 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 169 (Llyr Gruffydd) not moved.*

[479] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 170? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment 170?

[480] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Na, nid wyf yn dymuno symud hwnnw chwaith.

Llyr Gruffydd: No, I don't wish to move that one either.

[481] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Pawb yn hapus bod hwnnw yn cael ei dynnu'n ôl?

Alun Ffred Jones: Is everybody content that that is withdrawn?

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 170 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 170 (Llyr Gruffydd) not moved.*

[482] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 171?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 171?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 171 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 171 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[483] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Rwyf yn dymuno cynnig hwn.

Llyr Gruffydd: I do wish to move this amendment.

[484] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 171? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 171 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'r gwelliant wedi ei golli. Mae wedi syrthio.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 171 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 171, please indicate. And against. The amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 171: O blaid 4, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 171: For 4, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 171.
Amendment 171 not agreed.*

[485] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 172?

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, amendment 172?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 172 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 172 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[486] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[487] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 172? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 172 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 172.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 172 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 172, please indicate. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative, therefore amendment 172 is

not agreed.

*Gwelliant 172: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 172: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 172.
Amendment 172 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 53 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 53 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[488] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 53 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 53? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 53.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 53 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 53 be agreed. Does any Member object? No objection. Amendment 53 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 53 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 53 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

Grŵp 12: Ceisiadau i Weinidogion Cymru (Gwelliannau 173, 105, 106, 174, 107, 176, 108, 177, 178, 179, 180, 181, 182, 183, 184, 185, 186, 187, 188, 189 ac 111)
Group 12: Applications to Welsh Ministers (Amendments 173, 105, 106, 174, 107, 176, 108, 177, 178, 179, 180, 181, 182, 183, 184, 185, 186, 187, 188, 189 and 111)

[489] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn i grŵp 12 a cheisiadau i Weinidogion Cymru. Mae nifer o welliannau yma, a'r prif welliant yw 173 yn enw Llyr Gruffydd.

Alun Ffred Jones: Moving on to group 12 and applications to Welsh Ministers, there are a number of amendments here. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 173 in the name of Llyr Gruffydd.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 173 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 173 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[490] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I move amendments 173, 174 and 176 through to 189. I'll be voting in favour of all the amendments in this group.

[491] The first amendment in this group, amendment 173, sets the tone for all of my amendments in this group, really. The amendment simply deletes sections 62L and 62M, which allow the option to make applications directly to Welsh Ministers. This bypasses local democratic accountability for developments that are not of national significance, in my view. The amendment prevents further centralisation of power and seeks to protect the voice of

communities and democratic institutions.

[492] My other amendments are there in case 173 isn't carried, to seek to improve the section around applying to Welsh Ministers. In amendment 174, I propose explicitly preventing housing, retail or leisure developments from being considered developments of national significance—a point I made earlier. I'll be voting for amendment 108 in the name of Russell George, although if it passes I'll be amending it at Stage 3 to take out 'housing, retail and leisure' for the very same reason.

[493] My amendment 176 will require the Welsh Ministers to consult with all local planning authorities before publishing the criteria for designated authorities. It also requires the criteria to include qualitative and quantitative measures to ensure the process is thorough. This will ensure clarity for both local planning authorities and the public if a scenario rises whereby a local planning authority is designated. Amendment 185 removes the option to consider written evidence and changes 'at a hearing' to 'at a local hearing'. This protects the voice of local communities and guards against outside influences impacting on decisions. It forces decisions to be made based only on local hearings or inquiries. Amendment 186 gives clarity by defining the term 'local' and all the other amendments are consequential to those that I've already mentioned.

[494] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much, Llyr. Russell George i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much, Llyr. Russell George to speak.

[495] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. I move amendments 105, 106, 107, 108 and 111 within the grouping. There are two clear intended effects of these amendments. Amendment 105 and 107 are in relation to recommendation 5 made by the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee, which ask the Minister for an explanation as to how applications to Welsh Ministers would operate in practice, including what criteria Ministers would use to determine whether a local planning authority was underperforming, what types of development would apply, et cetera. The Minister gave a partial explanation, I think, in his letter of 26 February, in that it was likely Ministers would make designations based on indicators contained in the proposed performance framework that establishes what constitutes a good local planning authority, which were set out in the 'Positive Planning' consultation paper. However, what I'm proposing here is that we include on the face of the Bill a mechanism whereby the Government is required to lay the criteria designation of a local authority before the National Assembly, and that it will be adopted only if there's no motion to annul within 40 days. There's a similar mechanism that works in other parts of the UK.

[496] In relation to amendment 108, again, I've had concerns raised by a number of farmers and landowners in Wales that the intended definition of 'major development', as set out in the Government's 'Positive Planning' consultation, must be reconsidered, as adoption of the current definition places rural developments at a material disadvantage potentially. And, finally, regarding amendment 111, this is again a proposal to strengthen the process by which powers to make provision by development Order are dealt with on applications that are made directly to Welsh Ministers. Given that sections 20 to 25 provide potentially wide-ranging powers to Welsh Ministers, which, in effect, will take powers away from local authorities, I think it's reasonable that these checks are put in place.

[497] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much, Russell. Unrhyw Aelod arall eisiau siarad? **Russell:** Does any other Member wish to speak? No. Minister. Nac oes. Gweinidog.

[498] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. Poor performance by local authorities can severely affect economic prosperity and prevent the timely provision of new development that will benefit local communities. It is very rare, but not unheard of, that intervention powers are

used, and I believe they are appropriate. I think what we are very keen to do is to ensure that the criteria for intervention or designation are based on supported evidence from local planning authorities and other bodies that have an interest. We will consult on that process and then define that so that all authorities will understand how they are expected to perform. Of course, Members will be aware of some local authorities who are, or have in the past, been at risk of not delivering good-quality public services, and that is unacceptable to this Government. And, therefore, this gives us the provision within the Bill to do something about that.

[499] While I do understand the proposal in regard to the designation criteria needing to be robust and transparent, the principle of some of the amendments, as tabled today, I am sympathetic to, but not in the form they are drafted. I will again work with Members to see how we can clarify some of the detail around that in regards to understanding how people fully understand what the designation criteria would be and how that would be better informed. Some of the other amendments tabled by Russell George unfortunately would make section 20 of the Bill unworkable. I think he does recognise that, and, therefore, we will not be seeking to support that today.

12:00

[500] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Llyr to reply. Llyr Gruffydd i ymateb.

[501] **Llyr Gruffydd:** While I welcome the indication that the Minister is open-minded to further discussions around some of these issues, clearly, the key area for me is that there is a danger that certain applicants will see an opportunity to bypass local democratic structures and I think that is of concern. Of course, if you do take decisions away from local planning authorities, then how do you know that they're actually improving? So, there are a number of questions, I think, that need to be addressed, and I thank the Minister for recognising that maybe there is scope to do something further, but, obviously, I will be moving to a vote on these.

[502] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Pardon?

[503] **Llyr Gruffydd:** I will be keen to move to a vote on the amendments.

[504] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Ocê. Diolch yn fawr. Llyr, a hoffech chi symud i bleidlais ar welliant 173? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay. Thank you. Llyr, do you wish to move to a vote on amendment 173?

[505] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[506] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynnir gwelliant 173, bydd gwelliannau 105, 106, 174, 107 ac 176 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 173? Unrhyw gwrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 173 i ddangos os gwelwch yn dda. Tri. Ac yn erbyn—y mwyafrif, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 173. **Alun Ffred Jones:** If amendment 173 is agreed, amendments 105, 106, 174, 107 and 176 will fall. The question is that amendment 173 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 173 to indicate please. Three. And those against—the majority, therefore, amendment 173 falls.

*Gwelliant 173: O blaid 3, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.
Amendment 173: For 3, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Antoniw, Mick George, Russell Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Sandbach, Antoinette Watson, Joyce	

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 173.
Amendment 173 not agreed.*

[507] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell amendment 105.
gwelliant 105.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 105 (Russell George).
Amendment 105 (Russell George) moved.*

[508] **Russell George:** Move.

[509] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid dderbyn gwelliant 105? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais ar welliant 105. Dangoswch os ydych o blaid gwelliant 105 trwy godi eich dwylo. Diolch yn fawr. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 105.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 105 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote on amendment 105. All those in favour of amendment 105 please indicate. Thank you. And those against. It's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 105 falls.

*Gwelliant 105: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 105: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 105.
Amendment 105 not agreed.*

[510] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych yn dymuno cynnig gwelliant 106? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 106?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 106 (Russell George).
Amendment 106 (Russell George) moved.*

[511] **Russell George:** Move.

[512] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid dderbyn gwelliant 106? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 106 i ddangos. Yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 106.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 106 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 106 please indicate. And those against. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 106 falls.

*Gwelliant 106: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 106: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 106.
Amendment 106 not agreed.*

[513] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 174.

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 174?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 174 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 174 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[514] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[515] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 174? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 174 i ddangos hynny. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 174.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 174 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 174 please indicate. Those against. There's a tied vote. I use the casting vote in the negative. Amendment 174 falls.

*Gwelliant 174: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 174: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â

Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 174.

Amendment 174 not agreed.

[516] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 107?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 107 (Russell George).

Amendment 107 (Russell George) moved.

[517] **Russell George:** Move.

[518] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that a ddylid dderbyn gwelliant 107? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i amendment 107 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 107 i vote. All those in favour of amendment 107 i ddangos os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. to indicate please. And those against. It's a Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni tied vote. I use my casting vote in the dderbyniwyd gwelliant 107. negative. Amendment 107 falls.

Gwelliant 107: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 107: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 107.

Amendment 107 not agreed.

[519] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 176?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 176 (Llyr Gruffydd).

Amendment 176 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[520] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: I move.

[521] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 176? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i amendment 176 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a bleidlais ar 176. Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos to indicate please. Those against. There's a tied os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal.

Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd vote. Casting vote in the negative. The amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 176: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 176: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 176.
Amendment 176 not agreed.*

[522] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 108?
gwelliant 108.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 108 (Russell George).
Amendment 108 (Russell George) moved.*

[523] **Russell George:** Move.

[524] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that a ddylid dderbyn gwelliant 108? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i amendment 108 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 108 i vote. All those in favour of amendment 108 ddangos os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. please indicate. And those against. There's a Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni tied vote. Casting vote in the negative. dderbyniwyd gwelliant 108. Amendment 108 falls.

*Gwelliant 108: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 108: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 108.
Amendment 108 not agreed.*

[525] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 177.

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 177?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 177 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 177 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[526] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[527] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid dderbyn gwelliant 177? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 177. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 177.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 177 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 177 please indicate. And those against. There's a tied vote. I use the casting vote in the negative. Amendment 177 falls.

*Gwelliant 177: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 177: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 177.
Amendment 177 not agreed.*

[528] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 178.

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 178?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 178 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 178 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[529] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: I move.

[530] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid dderbyn gwelliant 178? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 178 i ddangos os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 178.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 178 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote therefore. All those in favour of amendment 178 to indicate. And those against. There's a tied vote. I use the casting vote in the negative. Amendment 178 falls.

*Gwelliant 178: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 178: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 178.
Amendment 178 not agreed.*

[531] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment 179.
179.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 179 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 179 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[532] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: I move.

[533] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid dderbyn gwelliant 179? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 179. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 179.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 179 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 179. And those against. It's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 179 falls.

*Gwelliant 179: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 179: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 179.
Amendment 179 not agreed.*

[534] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to
180. move to a vote on amendment 180?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 180 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 180 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[535] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: I move.

[536] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 180? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb o blaid gwelliant 180. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 180.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 180 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] I move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 180 please indicate. And those against. There's a tied vote. Casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 180 falls.

*Gwelliant 180: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 180: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 180.
Amendment 180 not agreed.*

[537] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 181.

Alun Ffred Jones: Llyr, amendment 181.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 181 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 181 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[538] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: I move.

[539] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 181? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 181 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 181.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 181 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 181 to indicate. And those against. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 181 falls.

*Gwelliant 181: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 181: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny

Sandbach, Antoinette

Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 181.
Amendment 181 not agreed.*

[540] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment 182.
182.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 182 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 182 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[541] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: I move.

[542] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 182? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb o blaid 182. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 182.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 182 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 182. And those against. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 182 falls.

Gwelliant 182: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 182: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 182.
Amendment 182 not agreed.*

[543] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment 183.
183.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 183 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 183 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[544] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: I move.

[545] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 183? Unrhyw amendment 183 be agreed. Does any

wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 183 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 183.

Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 183 please indicate. And those against. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 183 falls.

*Gwelliant 183: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 183: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 183.
Amendment 183 not agreed.*

Grŵp 13: Gwelliannau Canlyniadol i Orchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Penderfynu Gweithdrefn) (Cymru) 2014 (Gwelliannau 4, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 23, 24, 25, 26 a 27)

Group 13: Consequential Amendments on the Town and Country Planning (Determination of Procedure) (Wales) Order 2014 (Amendments 4, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 23, 24, 25, 26 and 27)

[546] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym ni'n symud i grŵp 13, sy'n ymwneud â gwelliannau canlyniadol i Orchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Penderfynu Gweithdrefn) (Cymru) 2014. Y prif welliant yw gwelliant 4 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: That brings us to group 13, which relates to consequential amendments on the Town and Country Planning (Determination of Procedure) (Wales) Order 2014. The lead amendment is amendment 4 in the name of the Minister.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 4 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 4 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[547] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 4 a galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad am ei welliant a'r gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 4 and call on the Minister to speak to his amendment and other amendments in this group.

[548] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. We wish to seek support for the amendments in the Government's name in group 13. These amendments seek only to tidy up the statute book. They do not alter any substance or policy contained in the Bill; therefore, I call on Members to support these amendments.

[549] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw Aelod arall sy'n dymuno siarad? Nac oes. A ydy'r Gweinidog eisiau ymateb i'w sylwadau fo ei

Alun Ffred Jones: Are there other Members who wish to speak? No. Does the Minister wish to reply to his own comments?

hun?

[550] **Carl Sargeant:** No. I'm very happy. [*Laughter.*]

[551] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A ydych chi'n dymuno symud i bleidlais ar welliant 4 felly? Os derbynnir gwelliant 4, bydd gwelliannau 184, 185, 186 a 187 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 4? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Derbyniwyd gwelliant 4.

Alun Ffred Jones: Do you wish to proceed to a vote, therefore, on amendment 4? If amendment 4 is agreed, amendments 184, 185, 186 and 187 will fall. The question is that amendment 4 be agreed. Does any Member object? Amendment 4 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 4 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.

Amendment 4 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.

Methodd gwelliannau 184, 185, 186 a 187.

Amendments 184, 185, 186 and 187 fell.

[552] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym ni'n symud, felly, i welliant gan Russell George, 109. A ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 109, Russell?

Alun Ffred Jones: We move, therefore, to an amendment by Russell George, 109. Do you wish to move amendment 109, Russell?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 109 (Russell George).

Amendment 109 (Russell George) moved.

[553] **Russell George:** Move.

[554] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 109? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 109 i ddangos os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Nid yw'r gwelliant wedi'i dderbyn.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 109 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 109 please indicate. And against. As there's a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, the amendment is not agreed.

Gwelliant 109: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 109: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 109.

Amendment 109 not agreed.

[555] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment 188.

188.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 188 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 188 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[556] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.**Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[557] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 188? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 188 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd y gwelliant.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 188 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. Therefore, all those in favour of amendment 188 to indicate. And those against. As there's a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. The amendment is not agreed.

Gwelliant 188: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 188: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 188.
Amendment 188 not agreed.

[558] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 189.**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 189?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 189 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 189 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.

[559] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.**Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[560] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 189? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 189 os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 189.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 189 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 189 please. And those against. As there's a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 189 is not agreed.

Gwelliant 189: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 189: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:

Yn erbyn:

Ymatal:

For:

Against:

Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 189.

Amendment 189 not agreed.

[561] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, gwelliant 110.

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 110?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 110 (Russell George).

Amendment 110 (Russell George) moved.

[562] **Russell George:** Move.

[563] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 110? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 110 i ddangos os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Mae hynny wedi'i cholli.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 110 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 110, please indicate. And against. That has fallen.

Gwelliant 110: O blaid 4, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Amendment 110: For 4, Abstain 0, Against 5.

O blaid:

Yn erbyn:

Ymatal:

For:

Against:

Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 110.

Amendment 110 not agreed.

[564] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, gwelliant 111.

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 111?

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 111 (Russell George).

Amendment 111 (Russell George) moved.

[565] **Russell George:** Move.

[566] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 111? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 111 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed

bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 111. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Nid yw'r gwelliant wedi'i dderbyn.

to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 111. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 111: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 111: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 111.
Amendment 111 not agreed.*

[567] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 112?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 112 (Russell George).
Amendment 112 (Russell George) moved.*

[568] **Russell George:** Move.

[569] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 112? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 112 os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 112.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 112 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of amendment 112. And against. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 112 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 112: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 112: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 112.
Amendment 112 not agreed.*

**Grŵp 14: Datganiadau Dylunio a Mynediad (Gwelliant 29)
Group 14: Design and Access Statements (Amendment 29)**

[570] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symud i grŵp 14, sef datganiadau dylunio a mynediad, y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 29 yn enw'r Gweinidog. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Moving to group 14, design and access statements, the lead amendment in the group is amendment 29 in the name of the Minister.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 29 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 29 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[571] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 29. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 29 and call on the Minister to speak to his amendment.

[572] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I seek support for amendment 29 in this group 14. The amendment in this group addresses the committee's recommendation 39 and removes section 27 of the Bill to retain the primary legislative requirement for design and access statements. I formally move.

[573] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Julie Morgan.

[574] **Julie Morgan:** Just very quickly, I seek support for amendment 29. I'm very pleased that the Minister has decided to put these amendments forward. I think it's very important that we do retain design and access statements, and I hope the amendment will be supported.

[575] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant— Sorri, y Gweinidog i ymateb. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right. The question is that—. Sorry, the Minister to reply.

[576] **Carl Sargeant:** I've nothing to add, Chair.

[577] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 29? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 29. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 29 be agreed. Does any Member object? No objections. Amendment 29 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 29 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 29 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

Grŵp 15: Ceisiadau Annilydys—Hysbysu ac Apelio (Gwelliannau 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39 a 28)

Group 15: Invalid Applications—Notice and Appeal (Amendments 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39 and 28)

[578] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symud i grŵp 15, sydd yn ymwneud â cheisiadau annilydys, hysbysu ac apelio yn erbyn ceisiadau annilydys, y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 30 yn enw'r Gweinidog. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Moving on to group 15, which relates to invalid applications on notice and appeal, the lead amendment in the group is amendment 30 in the name of the Minister.

Cynigiwyd gwelliant 30 (Carl Sargeant).

Amendment 30 (Carl Sargeant) moved.

[579] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 30. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 30 and call on the Minister to speak to his amendment.

[580] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I'm seeking support for amendments in this group in my name, in group 15. Amendment 33 seeks to broaden the scope of the provisions contained in section 28 of the Bill, which establish a new appeal process, to other types of applications in addition to applications for planning permission. It requires planning authorities in Wales to serve notice on an applicant where it considers that an application in relation to a condition attached to a planning permission is not valid. This is typical of all the amendments in this group. I formally move.

[581] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes Aelodau eraill eisiau siarad? Nid yw'r Gweinidog eisiau ymateb i'w hun. Symud i bleidlais ar welliant 30, felly. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 30? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Derbyniwyd gwelliant 30, felly. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Are there other Members who wish to speak? The Minister does not want to reply to himself. So, we'll move to a vote on amendment 30. The question is that amendment 30 be agreed. Does any Member object? Amendment 30 is agreed, therefore.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 30 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 30 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 31 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 31 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[582] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 31 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 31? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 31. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 31 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 31 be agreed. Does any Member object? No objection. Amendment 31 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 31 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 31 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 32 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 32 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[583] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 32 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 32? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Derbyniwyd gwelliant 32. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 32 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 32 be agreed. Does any Member object? Amendment 32 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 32 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 32 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 33 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 33 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[584] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 33 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 33 in the name of the Minister. Any objection? No objection. Amendment 33 is agreed.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 33.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 33 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 33 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 34 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 34 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[585] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 34 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 34. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 34 in the name of the Minister. Any objection? No objection. Amendment 34 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 34 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 34 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 35 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 35 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[586] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 35 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 35. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 35 in the name of the Minister. Any objection? No. Amendment 35 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 35 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 35 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 36 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 36 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[587] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 36 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 36. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 36 in the name of the Minister. Any objection? No objection. Amendment 36 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 36 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 36 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 37 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 37 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[588] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 37 rwy'n cynnig yn enw'r Gweinidog. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 37. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 37 in the name of the Minister. Is there any objection? No objection. Amendment 37 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 37 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 37 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 38 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 38 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[589] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 38 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim. Mae gwelliant 38 **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 38 in the name of the Minister. Any objection? None. Amendment 38 is agreed.

wedi'i dderbyn.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 38 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 38 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 39 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 39 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[590] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 39 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 39. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 39 in the name of the Minister. Any objection? No objection. Amendment 39 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 39 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 39 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[591] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 125 yn enw Suzy Davies? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 125 in the name of Suzy Davies?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 125 (Suzy Davies).
Amendment 125 (Suzy Davies) moved.*

[592] **Russell George:** Move.

[593] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 125? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 125 i ddangos os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 125. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 125 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 125 please indicate. Those against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 125 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 125: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 125: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 125.
Amendment 125 not agreed.*

12:15

[594] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, wyt ti'n **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to

dymuno cynnig gwelliant 190?

move amendment 190?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 190 (Llyr Gruffydd).
Amendment 190 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[595] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

Llyr Gruffydd: Move.

[596] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A ddylid derbyn gwelliant 190 ydy'r cwestiwn. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 190. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 190.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 190 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 190. And against. As there is a tied vote, I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 190 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 190: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 190: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 190.
Amendment 190 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 40 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 40 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[597] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 40 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 40 in the name of the Minister.

[598] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 40? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 40.

The question is that amendment 40 be agreed to. Does any Member object? No objection. Amendment 40 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 40 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.
Amendment 40 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[599] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 113?

Alun Ffred Jones: Russell, do you wish to move amendment 113?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 113 (Russell George).
Amendment 113 (Russell George) moved.*

[600] **Russell George:** Move.

[601] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 113? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 113 i ddangos os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 113.

Alun Ffred Jones: The question is that amendment 113 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 113 please indicate. And against. It's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 113 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 113: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 113: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid:
For:

Yn erbyn:
Against:

Ymatal:
Abstain:

George, Russell
Gruffydd, Llyr
Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William
Sandbach, Antoinette

Antoniw, Mick
Hedges, Mike
Morgan, Julie
Rathbone, Jenny
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 113.
Amendment 113 not agreed.*

Grŵp 16: Byrddau Cynllunio ar y Cyd a Pharciau Cenedlaethol (Gwelliannau 54 a 44) Group 16: Joint Planning Boards and National Parks (Amendments 54 and 44)

[602] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n credu bod gyda ni amser i wneud grŵp 16, byrddau cynllunio ar y cyd a pharciau cenedlaethol, gwelliannau 54 a 44. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 54 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

Alun Ffred Jones: I think that we have time to do group 16, joint planning boards and national parks, amendments 54 and 44. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 54 in the name of the Minister.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 54 (Carl Sargeant).
Amendment 54 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[603] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 54 a galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad.

Alun Ffred Jones: I move amendment 54 and call on the Minister to speak.

[604] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I seek your support for Government amendments 44 and 54 in group 16. Amendment 54 seeks to enable Welsh Ministers to extend the application of existing joint planning board provisions in section 2 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 to include national parks by means of regulations. The regulations would enable the transfer of development management functions only of the national park authorities to joint planning boards and the regulations would be subject to consideration and only with agreement of the National Assembly, not by Ministerial order.

[605] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Unrhyw aelod arall eisiau siarad? Llyr Gruffydd.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you. Does any other Member wish to speak? Llyr Gruffydd.

[606] **Llyr Gruffydd:** I haven't seen sufficient evidence to suggest any benefits, actually,

from merging the planning functions of national parks authorities with other local planning authorities. The Minister himself has said that they're performing as exactly as good—to quote the Minister—'as other local planning authorities'. My fear is that new joint planning boards wouldn't necessarily have the same strict duty to pursue national park purposes as does an independent park authority. This could diminish the protection of these nationally important areas and jeopardise their ability to deliver sustainable and integrated approaches to the use of land in their areas, and I'll be voting against the amendments in this group.

[607] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn, a Russell **Alun Ffred Jones:** And Russell George. George.

[608] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. We too shall be voting against these amendments. I think the committee at Stage 1 was very clear in its insistence that national park authorities should not be touched within the current planning process. There is scope within the Bill to make it possible to direct a national park authority and another local planning authority to produce a joint LDP, which gives the Government flexibility, so I obviously do not want to see another tier of confusing and costly administrative layer added to the development management system.

[609] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. The Minister Y Gweinidog i ymateb i'r ddadl. to reply to the debate.

[610] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, of course. The Member maybe slightly mistaken, in fact, in terms of the LDP process. We're not suggesting in this amendment at all that the LDP process should be merged with another authority. I'm suggesting that this gives a Minister the ability to table this, and therefore it will be the will of the Assembly, not of that of a Minister. I would ask the work of the Commission that is currently under way, that is being, effectively, worked through with the Commissioners and with the national parks—. Having the ability, from any recommendation in that report, would give flexibility for this to move forward. But it is not without the will of the Assembly and only with the will of the Assembly that this relationship of the amendments works through.

[611] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Weinidog, do you wish to move to a vote on amendment 54?

[612] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes please.

[613] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Reit. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 54? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid y gwelliant yma i ddangos os gwelwch yn dda. Diolch yn fawr. A phawb sydd yn erbyn. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 54 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of this amendment to indicate. And those against.

[614] What's that, William? Are you against or—?

[615] **William Powell:** I intend to abstain.

[616] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Abstain. Okay. So it's four objections, one abstention.

[617] Felly mae'r gwelliant wedi ei basio. Therefore the amendment is carried.

*Gwelliant 54: O blaid 5, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 4.
Amendment 54: For 5, Abstain 1, Against 4.*

O blaid:

Yn erbyn:

Ymatal:

For:	Against:	Abstain:
Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Sandbach, Antoinette	Powell, William

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 54.
Amendment 54 agreed.*

[618] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 114? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 114?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 114 (Russell George).
Amendment 114 (Russell George) moved.*

[619] **Russell George:** Yes. Move.

[620] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 114? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] I bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 114 i ddangos os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae'r gwelliant wedi'i fethu. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 114 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of amendment 114 please indicate. And those against. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, the amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 114: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.
Amendment 114: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William Sandbach, Antoinette	Antoniw, Mick Hedges, Mike Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 114.
Amendment 114 not agreed.*

[621] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Reit, rwy'n credu y gwnawn ni orffen yn fanna. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right, I believe we should conclude there.

[622] I think we'll call it a day at that section. We'll have to return for a return bout next week. We're nearly there. We weren't far off. It won't take long to finish this off. May I thank you all for your presence and for your forbearance?

[623] Iawn, diolch yn fawr. Right, thank you.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12:20.
The meeting ended at 12:20.